The Development of Educational and Methodical Framework of the Religious Educational Process in Secular Secondary Schools during the Modernization of the Russian Society (The Second Half of the 19th – Early 20th Centuries)

Gulshat M. Mustafina1 & Anton V. Yermoshin2

1 Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University, Kazan, Russia
2 Kazan Orthodox Theological Seminary, Kazan, Russia

Correspondence: Gulshat M. Mustafina, Kazan (Volga Region) Federal University, Kremlyovskaya Street 18, Kazan 420008, Russia. E-mail: tggpu_history_russia@mail.ru

Received: April 14, 2015   Accepted: April 20, 2015   Online Published: April 27, 2015
doi:10.5539/jsd.v8n4p86          URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/jsd.v8n4p86

Abstract
The importance of the research is determined by the cognitive functions of the institutional history, in this case in terms of the study of various aspects of the educational system as a special sphere of cooperation between the state and public institutions, as well as human and science. The aim of the article is to determine and analyze tendencies in the development of educational and methodological framework of the religious educational process (the process of teaching fundamentals of religion) in the secular educational environment of the particular era – the modernization period (the second half of the 19th – early 20th centuries) and in the particular region (Kazan as a typical provincial center of the Russian Empire). The main method of this study is the historical-comparative method, which allows to compare the experience in use of educational materials in secondary schools in Kazan applying historical records analysis. The results presented in the article show the influence of social, economic, political and cultural process taking place in the Russian Empire during the period of modernization on the religious educational process in secular schools, manifested, in particular, in the pluralization of educational and methodological framework. The materials of the article may be useful for the studies within the institutional history of education and the church, as well as for modern discussions about the place of religion in the secular educational environment.

Keywords: educational and methodological framework, gymnasium, God’s Law, Orthodox Church, Russian Empire, period of modernization

1. Introduction

1.1 Background
Modern Russian educational environment, which is in a continuous process of reformation and reorganization, stimulate the researchers to conduct a systematic research of the historical experience gained in this field. Especially significant is the research of the crisis periods experience, when contradictions that are less visible during periods of stable development of any system are strongly aggravated during the crisis.

Debates in modern Russia regarding the place and importance of religion in the educational environment of secular society indicate that this problem has not been solved and demand analysis of the experience of pre-revolutionary period which is characterized by the official functioning of the system of religious education in secular schools on the one hand, and by continuous discussions about this issue on the other.

1.2 Status of a Problem
Modern Russian historical science pays much attention to the problems of institutional history of education, and in particular, to such specific area as the Orthodox religious educational system in pre-revolutionary Russia (Vishlenkova, 1998; Sukhova, 2006). Moreover, the study of the formation of secular secondary education in the Russian Empire was significantly developed during the Soviet period (Ganelin, 1947; Smirnov, 1954).

These historiographic parallels determine another line of research – the study of the history of interaction
between the religious educational system and secular education implemented in the common pedagogical space. In the center of this space was the pre-revolutionary Russian gymnasium (and other secular secondary schools), because the subject the God’s Law was a compulsory segment of religious education in this school (Constitution, 1864). Modern researches often overlook this aspect, and the researchers of the Soviet period bypassed it for ideological reasons, criticizing it and leaving without analysis certain aspects, such as the development of educational and methodological framework.

Noting the contribution of pre-revolutionary researchers in the development of the issues raised in this article, it should be mentioned that many of them were engaged in the reconstruction of the history of particular gymnasia (Smirnov, 1884; Traubenberg, 1900; and others) without systematic analysis of the problem. An important exception is the study of the history and methodology of teaching the God’s Law performed by the catechist and educator D. Sokolov (Sokolov, 1874), but it covers only the beginning of the modernization period, whereas the subsequent decades give the researchers an important and interesting material for the analysis of the issue raised in the article.

1.3 The Research Hypothesis

The study of history of teaching the fundamentals of religion in secondary schools inevitably raises not only the questions: who was involved in the process of teaching, on which account did they work and how much work did they do, but also: how was it carried out, how was this process organized from the didactic and methodological point of view? Without answering these questions it is impossible to understand and evaluate the significance and the results of this phenomenon in pre-revolutionary secondary education.

First of all, it must be emphasized that the educational and methodological framework of the religious component of secondary education was an integral part of the general educational and methodical framework of the secondary school. The main part of the framework were textbooks, manuals and guides. To analyze them is very important for system research of the interaction between secular and religious educational processes in the common educational environment.

The beginning of the period of modernization (1860s) coincided with the final stage of the formation of religious education in secular schools, when there was a system of successive courses forming the subject the God’s Law, and basic textbooks and manuals were compiled for their study. These circumstances allow authors to hypothesize that modernization period was the time of development of this system and had a significant influence on it due to the fact that the religious component of the educational process was not only the way of passing religious knowledge to young people, but also an instrument of ideological influence on them, and it was associated with the political, social, economic and cultural development of the Russian Empire.

2. Experimental (Materials and Methods)

2.1 The Objectives of the Research

In research the following problems were raised: 1) to identify the secondary schools in Kazan of the second half of the 19th – early 20th centuries in which religious educational process was implemented; 2) to study the educational and methodological framework of teaching the fundamentals of religion in these schools; 3) to make comparative and typological analysis of educational materials in order to identify common and special features of a particular school; 4) to analyze the collected data in order to reproduce the overall picture of the interaction between secular secondary educational system and religious education in the common educational environment of the Russian Empire.

2.2 Theoretical and Empirical Methods

To test the hypothesis we used general scientific theoretical methods of analysis, synthesis, analogy as well as special-empirical methods: statistics, typologization and historical-comparative method.

2.3 The Basis of the Research

The research bases are Kazan gymnasia and other secondary schools of the second half of the 19th – early 20th centuries, which represent the local educational environment of the Russian secondary education in the period of modernization.

2.4 The Stages of the Research

The research was divided into three stages:

At the first stage we selected several secondary schools, typical for the Russian Empire at that period, located in the center of educational area, Kazan, which represent different types of secondary schools (schools for boys and
At the second stage on the basis of archival and published sources we identified lists of educational and methodological literature used in these schools for teaching various courses within the subject the God’s Law. At the third stage we made a comparative analysis of these lists in order to answer the questions of a working hypothesis: can these sources suggest the variety of educational and methodological framework of religious educational process?; is this diversity a specific feature of the modernization period of the Russian Empire?; did the social, political, economic and cultural process of this period influence the emergence and development of this diversity?

2.5 Evaluation Criteria

The hypothesis testing was made on the basis of such criteria as the effectiveness of religious educational process in secular educational institutions of Kazan (and the Russian Empire as a whole) conducted by catechists – the Orthodox clergy who used particular teaching aids. It is necessary to assess the effectiveness using both the indicators of students’ achievements and the analysis of debates regarding the educational and methodological materials which contain relevant criticism.

2.6 Proceedings and Description of the Experiment

At the initial stage of the experiment we chose several Kazan secondary educational establishments that belonged to different types of schools. Kazan gymnasiums for boys number 1 and 2 can be considered as typical examples of the classical schools of the Russian Empire. Kazan non-classical schools were typical vocational schools, and Mariinsky gymnasium for girls, Rodoionovsky Institute for Noblegirls and etc. were classical secondary schools for girls.

The analysis of educational and methodological literature used in these schools showed that the choice of textbooks on the same course depended both on the type of school and the preferences of the catechist, which does not imply the clear consistency in the approach to this choice.

However, the wide range of textbooks, formed by the beginning of the 20th century, suggest the influence of public debate (mainly of social and political character rather than of religious one) on the process of compiling these textbooks and on the teachers’ and students’ desire to have an independent choice.

3. Results

3.1 The Content of the Course God’s Law in Secondary Schools of the Second Half of the 19th – Early 20th Centuries

According to the gymnasium Constitution of 1871 in the 1st grade of gymnasium for boys, the students learned about the main Orthodox prayers and the sacred history of the Old Testament. In the 2nd grade they learned sacred history of the New Testament, in the 3rd and 4th grades – catechism. In the 5th grade the fundamentals of worship were taught, in the 6th grade – the history of the Universal and Russian Church. In the 7th grade the students revised the material of the whole gymnasium course (Distribution, 1871).

In 1872 the teaching of catechism was shifted from the 3rd and 4th grades to the 4th and 5th grades, and the fundamentals of worship – to the 3rd grade. These changes were necessary because the students of the 3rd grade due to their age and development were not able to acquire the dogmatic truths (L’vov, 1885).

The researcher of this problem D. Sokolov notes that the course of the fundamentals of worship was introduced in 1851 instead of the "doctrine of the duties of a christian" which was to some extent Protestant because of its origin (Sokolov, 1874).

Similar to gymnasiums for boys, non-classical and other vocational schools (Kazan non-classical secondary school, 1886; Kazan School of Commerce, 1913) had the course of the God’s Law. In the secondary schools for girls the teaching of the God’s Law was the same as in the all-boys schools (Smirnov, 1884). In the early 1880s the God’s Law was introduced in the curriculum of the 8th grade in Kazan secondary schools for girls. The 8th grade in Mariinsky gymnasium was profession-oriented – pedagogical. So it was decided to teach the methodology of teaching the God’s Law, preparing schoolgirls for possible future teaching the fundamentals of religion in primary schools and at home (Smirnov, 1884). The same difference was in curriculum of the L.P. Shumkova private school for girls in Kazan (Kazan L.P. Shumkova gymnasium for girls, 1910), and Kazan Rodoionovsky Institute for Noblegirls, due to the pedagogical orientation of these institutions.

Although there were programs which met the requirements of the Constitution, during the period of liberal reforms of the 1860s appeared author programs for the God’s Law developed by experienced catechists. For
example, during the period of liberal gymnasium Constitution of 1864 at the Kazan gymnasium for boys number 2 the author program was used for teaching the God’s Law. This program was developed by the catechist of the school M.M. Zefirov and approved by the teachers council on March 17, 1865 (Gvozdev, 1876). But after the gymnasium counter-reform and the introduction of the Constitution of 1871 the teachers used the program which fully corresponded to the curriculum issued by the Ministry of Education in 1872, which is emphasized by the author of the source (Gvozdev, 1876). Thus, the reality of the social and political life of the country had a direct influence on the teaching of the God’s Law at schools.

3.2 Educational and Methodological Literature for Different Courses of the God’s Law in the Post-Reform Period

Changes in the teaching of the God’s Law, caused by the Constitution of 1864, demanded the creation of a full pack of textbooks and manuals of the new generation, but the literature created in the previous period, including the authors of the 18th century, was still used.

In the middle of the 19th century new textbooks on the history of the Old and New Testament appeared, their authors are D.S. Abryutsky (2nd edition in 1854), V.D. Berezin (1844), I.M. Skvortsov (1838 and 1842), M.G. Bogdanov (1843, in 1869 – 17th edition). These books were based on the "Reading of Holy Scripture" and under the influence of "Outlines of Biblical history," written by Metropolitan Filaret (Drozdov). At the same time, new textbooks and teaching materials on church history were developed by A.N. Muravyev (1838), N.F. Raevsky (1847 and 1849), M.G. Bogdanov (1841) et al. (Sokolov, 1874).

The next generation of textbooks were books on biblical and church history written by A. Rudakov (1854, 1856, 1858 and later), N. Popov (1868 and 1880), P. Sokolov (2nd edition in 1866), M. Bogoslovsky (1857 and 1859), D. Sokolov (1866 and later), G. Chełtsov (40th edition in 1911), A. Lavrov (1869 and 1870), A. Lebedev (1873) and I. Romanov (1873). These textbooks were particularly valuable because they clearly explained the text of the Bible at the time when there was no complete translation of the Bible into Russian (it was published only in 1876). The textbooks on the church history of these authors were the first attempts to move away from the established clichés and to have a critical look at some facts (Sokolov, 1874).

Thus, by the mid-1870s not only a range of gymnasium textbooks on biblical and church history had significantly increased, but also there were textbooks which used original approach to the selection and periodization of the material, and had their own methodological features. It is also necessary to note that they were not just "books for reading" written for general use, but gymnasium textbooks created for a particular class and in relation to a particular program. All of them passed through the strict religious censorship, were approved by the Holy Synod and allowed for use in the respective schools by the Ministry of Education.

Since mid-1870s "Notes on the subject of the God’s Law" by A. Lavrov was used as the textbook for teaching worship and doctrine. This book, compiled according to the curriculum of 1872 for the 3rd – 5th grades of gymnasium for boys and included in the "Catalogue of libraries of the secondary schools of the Ministry of Education," in 1917 already had 25 publications and was also recommended for educational institutions of Department of Empress Maria’s Institutions (Lavrov, 1917).

The first chapter (for the 3rd grade) is dedicated to "The Doctrine of Worship of the Christian Orthodox Church", the second – to the "Original teaching of the principal truths of the Orthodox Christian faith" (4th – 5th grades). The content is close to the Catechism written by Metropolitan of Moscow Filaret (Drozdov).

At the same time the Catechism of Metropolitan Filaret (Drozdov) remained the main and the only textbook to study the relevant chapters of the God’s Law, from the time of its first use and in the subsequent time. Consequently, the subject Catechism did not provide a variety of educational literature in comparison with the biblical history, the history of the Church and worship. But on the whole, the post-reform period was not only the time of creation of a significant number of new books on the God’s Law, but also a period of relatively broad independence in their choice.

3.3 The Process and the Results of the Experiment

A significant increase in the educational literature on the God’s Law led to serious discrepancies in teaching in various secondary schools. For example, in Kazan progymnasium (according to the data of October 13, 1871) the following textbooks and manuals on the God’s Law were used: in the preparatory class – "The First Lessons on the Orthodox Christian Faith" by D. Sokolov, "The Biblical History" by I. Bazarov; in the 1st and 2nd grades – "The Sacred History" by N. Popov; in the 3rd and 4th grades – the Catechism of Metropolitan Filaret (National Archive of the Republic of Tatarstan, 92, 1/10442, p. 95). For comparison, in the Kazan Teachers Training Institute in 1882 and 1883 textbooks on the God’s Law were "The Sacred History of the Old and New
Testament” by A. Rudakov, “History of the Church” and “The Doctrine of Worship” of the same author, the Catechism of Metropolitan Filaret (National Archive of the Republic of Tatarstan, 92, 1/15666, p. 130; 92, 1/16164, p. 173). In 1886, in the Kazan non-classical secondary school the students could use the textbooks “The Sacred History” written by different authors, A. Rudakov, D. Sokolov or N. Popov, at the same time (the Kazan non-classical secondary school, 1886). In his author’s educational program M. Zefirov considered the textbook written by I. Bazarov sufficient for teaching the Old Testament in the 1st grade (Gvozdev, 1876).

At the turn of the 20th century the methodology of teaching the God’s Law again came under question and this brought to life new textbooks and teaching aids. Among the most popular textbooks of the late 19th – early 20th centuries are “The History of the Christian Orthodox Church” by P. Smirnov, the eponymous work of the Bishop Vasily (Preobrazhensky) (1908), “The Sacred History of the Old Testament” and “The Sacred History of the New Testament with the notes to the Gospel” (1903) written by A. Temnomerov. They quickly came into wide use in addition to textbooks compiled in the second half of the 19th century.

Thus, in the 1899/1900 academic year the first non-classical secondary school, gymnasium for boys number 3 and Mariinsky gymnasium for girls used textbooks by N. Popov to study the history of the Old and New Testament (whereas the gymnasium for boys number 2 used textbooks by A. Rudakov), but the teaching of history of the church was based on the new textbook by P. Smirnov, except for the non-classical secondary school, where the old textbook by A. Rudakov was used (List of books, 1899).

New textbooks were also used in L.P. Shumkova private school for girls in Kazan. In 1910 the fundamentals of God’s Law were taught in preparation classes with the use of the textbook by A. Temnomerov. The same book was used to study the Sacred History of the Old Testament (1st grade) and the New Testament (2nd grade) and study Worship (3rd grade). The textbook by I. Romanov was used to teach the Catechism lessons in the 4th and 5th grades, and the textbook by the Bishop Vasily (Preobrazhensky) was used to study the History of the Church in the 6th and 7th grades. The doctrine of the basic truths of the Orthodox Church was studied in the 8th grade with the use of the textbook by I. Vinogradov, which was also used to study the methodology of teaching the God's Law (in the same grade) (Kazan L.P. Shumkova gymnasium for girls, 1910). None of these books had been known since 1860-70s.

The introduction of the new textbooks with partial use of the old books at the turn of the 20th century can be seen in the comparative table where we presented textbooks used in 1899/1900 academic year in four secondary schools: Kazan gymnasiums for boys number 2 and 3, Mariinsky gymnasium for girls and Kazan non-classical secondary school (List of textbooks, 1899).

### Table 1. Textbooks and teaching materials on the God’s Law used in different types of secondary schools in Kazan in 1899/1900 academic year

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade</th>
<th>Mariinsky gymnasium for girls</th>
<th>Gymnasium for boys number 2</th>
<th>Gymnasium for boys number 3</th>
<th>Non-classical secondary school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Preparatory class</td>
<td>Chel’tsov G. “The God’s Law”</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Archbishop Agafodor “Lessons on the God’s Law for different types of primary schools and institutions”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3 Rudakov A. "The Short Doctrine of Worship of the Orthodox Church" The Gospel (in the Old Church Slavonic and Russian languages)
Sokolov D. "The Doctrine of Worship of the Orthodox Church" The Gospel (in the Old Church Slavonic and Russian languages)

4 Metropolitan Filaret "The Catechism" The New Testament (in the Old Church Slavonic and Russian languages)

5 Metropolitan Filaret "The Catechism" The New Testament (in the Old Church Slavonic and Russian languages)
The table shows that although the teaching in these schools met the requirements of the general program, it had its own distinctive features. For example, Mariinsky gymnasium used only textbooks (however, we do not exclude that the original sources were also used on the lessons). But in the 8th grade the students not only revised the material of the previous years, but also studied the methodology of teaching the God's Law (textbooks by D. Sokolov and N. Strakhov). This is due to the fact that the 8th grade in Mariinsky gymnasium was profession-oriented – pedagogical.

The students of Kazan gymnasiums for boys number 2 and 3 studied worship in the 3rd grade, having quite thorough preparation, because they were already familiar with some liturgical books (especially in the gymnasium number 2). In these gymnasiums much emphasis was placed on the study of the Holy Scriptures of the New Testament. In this respect, the non-classical secondary school was inferior to the gymnasiums.

Another peculiarity concerns the choice of textbooks. We can see that some authors have a whole chain of the successive textbooks (e.g. by A. Rudakov). But while in the non-classical secondary school, gymnasium for boys number 2 and Mariinsky gymnasium for girls the sacred history of the Old and New Testament was taught with the use of textbooks by N. Popov, and the worship – with the use of the textbook by A. Rudakov, the gymnasium for boys number 2, on the contrary, used the textbook by A. Rudakov to teach the sacred history of the Old and New Testaments and the textbook by D. Sokolov to teach the worship. However, the history of the church in all three gymnasiums was taught with the use of the textbook by P. Smirnov, and in the non-classical secondary school the textbook by A. Rudakov was used. This could hardly improve the quality of education because it is better to use a set of books by one author, and this opportunity was available.

4. Discussions

As mentioned above, the post-reform period was the time of pluralism in the choice of educational literature and
demonstrates the desire of the catechists to have more freedom in teaching their subject, which is explained by the spirit of the times. But, as in public life, these aspirations met the response of the authorities: the Ministry of Education and the authorities of Kazan School District regularly attempted to control the use of textbooks. They not only insisted on the use of a certain textbook, but also suggested programs on the use of its material. For example, in 1871 the catechists had to use textbooks by A. Rudakov to teach the sacred history of the Old and New Testaments in the 1st and 2nd grades. "The Catechism" of Metropolitan Filaret was recommended for teaching catechism in the 3rd and 4th grades. "The Doctrine of Worship" by A. Rudakov was recommended for the 5th grade and "The History of the Universal and Russian Church" by the same author – for the 6th grade (Distribution, 1871). The programs contained the detailed guidance to exclude certain paragraphs from the study, which demonstrated the intention of school authorities to bring the existing textbooks (the number of which was increasing) to the requirements of the curriculum.

This tendency increased at the turn of the 20th century, when along with the increasing society's desire for pluralism (related to the beginning of the various political parties' activity) new textbooks on the same parts of the God’s Law were published. They became so numerous that the government attempted to regulate their choice: "With a variety of study guides, approved by the Ministry, the teacher must choose for each subject and for each grade one of the textbooks adopted in the school" (Bystrov, 1911).

However, it was difficult to control objectively developing process by policy measures, so the creation of new textbooks not only continued but, on the contrary, numerous discussions of the early twentieth century constantly raised the question of creating new educational literature which corresponded to the spirit and requirements of the time (Minutes of the Congress of the catechists, 1913).

5. Conclusions

During the period of modernization of the Russian society (the second half of the 19th – early 20th centuries) educational and methodological framework of religious education in secular schools had undergone a significant evolution. Following the development of the methodology of secondary education, it was not always provided with contemporary educational literature, and in the 1860-1870s textbooks of the preceding period were widely used. They also had an impact on the content of the new textbooks actively compiled in the next decades.

Some catechists of the Kazan school district took part in the creation of textbooks in this period (the second half of the 19th – early 20th centuries); these textbooks were of the Russian nature and did not reflect any local peculiarities.

In general, it must be admitted that the textbooks on various parts of the God’s Law in most cases poorly reflected the latest achievements of church-academic science, taking the content of the course of the God's Law, not only from the courses of secular gymnasium disciplines, but also from the theological and church-historical disciplines in theological schools.

Acknowledgments

The work is performed according to the Russian Government Program of Competitive Growth of Kazan Federal University

References


Lavrov, A. (1917). Zapiski po predmetu Zakona Bozhiya dlya III, IV i V klassov muzhskikh gimnaziy,
sostavlennye primenitelno k programme uchebnykh planov 1872 g. i k rukovodstvu Vysokopreosvyashchennogo mitropolita Filareta (s dopolneniem obyasneniya tekstov Svyashch. Pisaniya i ukazaniem razlichiya mezdu pravoslavnyy veroy i drugimi khristianskimi veroispovdaniyami). Moscow: Tipografiya tovarishchestva Ryabushkinskih.


Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/).