Educating Prisoners of Tradition: Visual Narratives of Afghan Women on Social Media

Esmaeil Zeiny Jelodar1, Ruzy Suliza Hashim2, Noraini Md Yusof2, Raihanah M. M. 2, Shahizah Ismail Hamdan2 & Peivand Zandi2

1 Center for Occidental Studies, Institute of Malaysian and International Studies (IKMAS), National University of Malaysia (UKM), Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia
2 School of Language Studies and Linguistics, National University of Malaysia (UKM), Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia

Correspondence: Esmaeil Zeiny Jelodar, Center for Occidental Studies, Institute of Malaysian and International Studies (IKMAS), National University of Malaysia (UKM), 43600 Bangi, Selangor, Malaysia. Tel: 60-172-815-502. E-mail: mehdizeiny@gmail.com

Received: December 26, 2013   Accepted: February 10, 2014   Online Published: February 22, 2014
doi:10.5539/ies.v7n3p60            URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ies.v7n3p60

Abstract

More than a decade after the US-led intervention of Afghanistan, traditional and tribal customs still play a significant role in the everyday lives of people, especially women. History has proven that women have been playing a significant role in shaping the course of Afghanistan but unfortunately, they are always subjected to different degrees of force by patriarchy and traditions. By examining the historical perspective of women’s status in Afghanistan and by analyzing two Youtube documentaries on women’s imprisonment, we argue that 12 years after the US-led intervention, women are still suffering from traditional and tribal laws. This paper seeks to demonstrate that untraditional education is a “sine qua non” for the women of Afghanistan to overcome negative aspects of tradition and tribal laws.

Keywords: Afghan women, tradition, patriarchy, education

1. Introduction

At different points throughout history, Afghan women have been the subjects of policies drafted to curtail their rights and status where varying degrees of coercion have been recruited to impose these policies. However, it is only the last decade that issues of violence against women and their social suffering have received substantive attention, especially in Taliban era. The plights of women under the Taliban rule served as a justification for the Western military powers in the name of freedom of women. Following 9/11, America and its allies focused their attention to Afghanistan and the imminent military action. Concomitant with claims about punitive action for this attack, the west administration accused Taliban with violations of women’s right. In the then First Lady, Laura Bush’s radio address to the nation on November 17, 2001, she asserted: “Life under the Taliban is so hard and repressive, even small displays of joy are outlawed. Children aren’t allowed to fly kites; their mothers face beatings for laughing out loud.” In her final remarks that day, she concluded that “the brutal oppression of women is a central goal of the terrorist.” She stated that the Taliban’s treatment of Afghan women and children is an obvious picture of “the world the terrorists would like to impose on the rest of us.”

Shortly after Laura Bush’s radio address, the State Department issued a report on “The Taliban’s War against Women.” Almost a month later, to reinforce this statement, George W. Bush said: “for several years the people of Afghanistan have suffered under one of the most brutal regimes in modern history. A regime allied with terrorists and a regime at war with women.” This leads one to the question of “whether women’s status and conditions are any better after the US-led invasion of the country?” Women of Afghanistan might have gained some freedoms such as venturing in the streets without the company of their men but traditions still play an important role in their lives. Once the Taliban were driven from power, women's hope was raised up but in vain because of traditions. It is important to note that this paper has no intention whatsoever to reject all the traditional rules and practices in Afghanistan as there are positive customs and traditions as well. Its attempt is to highlight patriarchal enforcements of some customs and traditions which affect women. By highlighting them, we bring these negative traditions to the attention of educational policy-makers and the educated segments of the society to
change these traditions and to pave the way for a positive future. Traditions such as severe discrimination, forced marriages, child bride marriages and sexual violence still persist to inflict the lives of women and girls throughout the country. Penitentiary is the response to the sporadic violation of traditions. The mainstream media is still fraught with documentaries portraying women in shapeless burqas which previously served to solidify the justification of “war on terror”. There are also a great number of documentaries on social media such as Youtube which probe and narrate the lives of Afghan women whose status has not improved since Western allies drove the Taliban from power. These Youtube documentaries continue to frame Afghan women as powerless and victims of patriarchal oppression. This relatively new media has provided Afghan women a means to directly address a globe wide audience but it should not be understood as reinforcing a cliché Western understanding of the “Orient”, rather they truly display the plights of women as shackled up within longstanding traditional customs. These documentaries could act as good catalysts for educational policy-makers to come up with a new policy to save Afghanistan from its illiteracy which led to women inferiority.

2. Bird’s Eye-View of Women’s Status

Discrimination and violence against women are of common phenomena in today’s Afghanistan. However, Afghanistan has a far more liberal past regarding women’s right and status, and women of Afghanistan were not always oppressed by patriarchal rules. Although their freedom did never last long because of traditions, Afghan women played significant and influential roles in the history of Afghanistan; sadly however, their contributions are not well-documented. In 1880 a woman named Malalai from the small village of Khig played a major role in the battle of Maiwand during the second Anglo-Afghan war. When the tide tuned against Afghan fighters, she cried out: “Young love, if you do not fall in the battle of Maiwand, by God someone is saving you as a token of shame” (Najmi, 2012, p. 1). Although she was killed in the battle, her words revitalized the Afghan soldiers and as the result, the Afghan soldiers left the battle in victory. The modern Afghanistan began with the rule of Abdu Rahman Khan who ruled the country from 1880 to 1901. As the first ruler to attempt strengthening the nation into a centralized state, he put a lot of effort into modifying some of the traditional and customary laws that were pernicious to women’s status such as abolishing the tribal customs of forcing a woman to marry her deceased husband’s next of kin, raising the age of marriage, giving women the right to divorce and allowing women to inherit property. Dupree (1986, p. 12) believes that Khan’s wife, Bobo Jan, might have impacted Khan as “she was the first Afghan queen to appear in public in European dress without a veil. She rode horses and trained her maidservants in military exercises.” The Queen had a “keen interest in politics and went on numerous delicate missions to discuss politics between contending parties” (Dupree, 1986, p. 12).

Amir Habibullah Khan took over the throne after his father and continued his father’s progressive agendas in the country. His numerous wives were seen unveiled in public and he was the first person to open a school for girl. His progressive agendas, especially related to women, were seen as against the religion and tradition. Magnus and Naby (1998, p. 39) believe that the “liberalization of the nation through education and modernization of even the ‘tiny elite’ spawned an opposition movement.” According to Ahmed-Ghosh (2003), Habibullah’s modernization programs such as education for women and state’s meddling in marriage institutions posed a challenge to the patriarchal system of the tribal leaders which led to his assassination in 1919. After his assassination, his son Amanullah reigned over Afghanistan. Ammanullah and his wife Queen Soraya along with her father Mahmud Tarzai cared for women’s right and they did try to improve their status. Polygamy was discouraged; education for girls was highly encouraged and they campaigned against the veil. At a public function Amanullah announced that religion never requires women to cover their hands, feet and faces and tribal customs must not be imposed on women. This was the time when his wife, Queen Soraya took her veil off in public which was followed by the wives of other officials present at the function. King’s sister, Kobra, established an organization to protect women. This organization encouraged women to be articulate and to fight against oppression and injustices. Queen Soraya founded the first women magazine named Ershad-E-Niswan (Guidance for women) (Qazi, 2009).

Having seen women gaining more freedom day by day, various conservative tribal leaders developed coalitions to protest the women’s freedom. It was the last straw for these conservative leaders to see girls’ marriage age was raised to 18, polygamy was abrogated and girls could receive education. They pushed against women’s education and freedoms to the extent that King Amanullah had to reverse some of his introduced agendas to tally with traditional policies. Girls’ schools were shut down and women had to veil again. Modernization could not beat traditionalism as traditional tribal rules were being reinstated. Stewart (1973) argues that Amanullah married another wife to ameliorate the situation and to appease the opposition but it was too late to mend. He was forced to relinquish his throne and leave Afghanistan in 1929. Many of the reforms introduced by King Amanullah were pushed back to the traditional tribal customs by the next King, Nadir Shah. He was very cautious not to upset the
traditional and conservative tribal leaders but he risked opening schools for girls and tried to bring some minor changes for women which took its toll and led to his assassination in 1933 (Ahmed-Ghosh, 2003). Zahir Shah was the next King who tried to bring change very slowly and gradually. He and his Prime Minister Mohammad Daoud were vigilant not to make the same mistake in promoting women’s right; unlike their predecessors, they announced that veiling is a “voluntary option”.

This period has witnessed women’s being employed as teachers, nurses and politicians. Women were offered the right to vote and in 1965 the Democratic Organization of Afghan Women (DOAW) was established to fight illiteracy and forced marriages (Qazi, 2009). It should be noted that these progresses were only restricted to women residing in Kabul as tradition had its tough hold in other parts of the country. During the presidency of Mohammad Daoud Khan (1973-1978) women gained more personal freedoms and rights. Women had representatives in the Parliament and were recruited as faculty members in the universities (Dupree, 1986). The rapid progresses for women such as compulsory education were considered by conservative tribal leaders as unbearable intervention in domestic life. The mandatory education for women raised a lot of eyebrows and challenged the male patriarchy as it caused backlashes and resentments amongst traditional forces. According to Moghadam (1997), women attired in western clothes were shot and women social workers were troubled by religious and traditional men. In December 1979, the Soviet occupied Afghanistan and Afghan fighters became involved in a decade long war. These Afghan fighters fought the Soviet because of its socialist agenda to eradicate the traditions and customs of Afghanistan. Fueled by forces outside the country, these Afghan fighters namely ‘Mujahideen’ fought in the name of Islam and wanted to reverse the changes in the field of women’s education and rights brought about by People Democratic Party of Afghanistan (PDPA), a group heavily supported by the Soviet.

During Dr. Najibullah’s reign (1989-1992), the Mujahideen were still waging war against the communist government and finally in 1992 they took over Kabul and saved Afghanistan from the Communists. They announced that Afghanistan is an Islamic state which was the time for women to start losing the gained rights and freedoms. Women could not venture outside unless dressed in a head-to-toe garment with a veil on their face. Ahmed-Ghosh (2003, p. 7) argues that the “period from 1992-1996 saw unprecedented barbarism by the Mujahideen where stories of killings, rapes, amputations and other forms of violence were told daily. To avoid rape and forced marriages, young women were resorting to suicide.” In 1996, a group called “Taliban” came to power to counter the savages of Mujahideen but they imposed severe restrictions on Afghan women. Qazi (2009) argues that women were prohibited to work and could not leave the house without the company of a related man. They could not see male doctors and all the female doctors were ordered to abandon their services. Women's were victimized and oppressed under the Taliban because of their orthodox interpretation of religious law and traditional customs.

After the events of 9/11, America and its allies attacked the Taliban and Al Qaeda and ousted them from the country. Finally in December 2001, the last Taliban stronghold fell in Afghanistan and the Taliban rules ended in Afghanistan. On the changes that the American intervention brought to Afghanistan, Laura Bush (2002) states “because of our recent military gains in much of Afghanistan, women are no longer imprisoned in their homes. They can listen to music and teach their daughters without fear of punishment”. Deleted from this elevated discourse of victory was the reality that many civilians including women were killed by the US-dropped half a million tons of bombs. Ignored in the lofty discourse of the victory of the west was the fact that tradition and patriarchy, which have been holding a strong control over women in Afghanistan, did not fade away. It is true that women officially gained back their freedoms and rights; they are no longer banished from their work, they can continue their education and some of them are appointed in governmental administrations but unfortunately, despite these gains, women are still being abused by traditional customs and laws of the patriarchal society.

3. Imprisoned Women’s Narratives on Youtube

There are more than a couple of documentaries on Youtube portraying Afghan women in jail. These imprisoned women narrate the mediaeval reality of the quotidian everyday life of women in today Afghanistan. The majority of these women are jailed for what Afghan courts deem as “moral crimes” such as refusing arranged marriages, marrying without father’s consent and running away from home. “Prisoners of Tradition: Women in Afghanistan” (2012) is one of these Youtube documentaries produced by Ariane Wu, Center for Investigative Reporting (CIR). The documentary begins with portraits of different women in prison. The story begins with a woman named Sohelia whose father put her in prison. She sates “I did not want to be with him, he had two wives already. My father wanted to take me to Nuristan to get married with that man. As soon as I learned, I ran away with my lover.” Her father wanted her to marry an old man in exchange for a piece of land. She was supposed to be the third wife of that man when she eloped. “When my father found me, he put me in prison” asserts Sohelia who is
sentenced to six years of prison and gave birth while jailed. Her baby has never seen the outside world and needs to be there four more years. Soheila’s father still visits her in prison and argues that if she accepts my decision to marry the guy I have chosen for her, she will be released.

Since Afghanistan is a male-dominated society, fathers and brothers have the rights to decide for the women of the family. The new Afghan constitution written in 2004 has given women more freedom and a number of new rights such as the rights to vote, to work, to receive education and to ask for justice in court. Theoretically, women might have gained freedom as it is written in the constitution but in practice neither society nor the authorities honor these rights. In the documentary, Gul Ghutai, women’s right’s lawyer, notes that “if the husband disappears for more than three years, Afghan law says the wife can go to court and ask for a divorce. But according to Shari’a law [and tradition], a woman has to wait for her husband for 70 years.” Tribalism and traditionalism have always prevailed despite the law. Another story is narrated by an 18 year old woman Latifeh who went to a male neighbor and implored him to do whatever he could to disentangle her from the brutalities of her husband. She mentions that “we would fight every night. My husband would put a pillow on my mouth and sit on my head as if he wanted to kill me. Only when I was close to dying did he let me free.” Asking for help and running away from abusive husband led to her imprisonment. The 2004 new constitution does not mean anything to these people because many of the people of Afghanistan are from traditional communities that very rigidly adhere to their local cultures and customs.

Another documentary on imprisoned Afghan women is “Love Crimes of Kabul” (2011) which is one of the most watched Youtube clips produced by Tanaz Eshaghian for HBO. ‘Love Crimes of Kabul’ is an intimate portrait of three young women indicted of perpetrating “moral crimes” such as running away from home and premarital sex. The documentary is set inside Kabul’s Badum Bagh prison where Kareema, Aleema and Sabereh are held awaiting their trial for the committed offenses. Kareema, 20, has a unique situation because she turned herself in and her boyfriend in to the authorities after her boyfriend impregnated her and refused to marry her. Both of them are accused of premarital sex which could face a strict verdict of 15 years in prison unless they marry. The girl’s and the boy’s family are not happy with this marriage as they are from different tribes. Kareema’s father says when he is going out he covers his face so that people in the neighborhood do not recognize him. He had chosen her a husband but Kareema loved Firuz. Apparently, Kareema uses tradition to her advantage and had the boy marry her in court despite the parents’ disagreement. However tradition and tribalism played a large role in Kareema’s case in the settling of the dowry and her love for the boy. Firuz’s father says “she is not worth what she is asking for” as she is from a different tribe and finally she was unable to attain a sufficient amount. Kareema seems lovesick over a boy who does not care about her half as much as she does about him. Tradition has never taught these men the true value of a woman.

Aleema is accused of running away from home. She did not return to her home after the 4 pm curfew for fear of being beaten. She went to a woman, Zia Jan to seek refuge. Zia Jan has a married son named Mohebullah but it is thought as if Aleema went to her house to have illicit affair with her son. The three of them are jailed and to reduce their sentences Aleema must choose to marry Mohebullah. Zia Jan thinks it fit that Aleema marry Mohebullah to restore their family honor but Aleema did not concede and very intrepidly decides to do the time in the prison instead of marrying him and release. All she did was taking shelter in a woman’s house for not having to face domestic beating. She is told that once released, her brother would literally “drown” her. Sabereh is an 18 year old girl who is imprisoned because she was caught having a meal with her boyfriend in her home. Her father takes them to the authorities and they are accused of pre-marital sex but her virginity is confirmed by the doctors. Later, she is accused of having anal sex which she repudiates. The only way for her to get out is marrying the boy but the boy’s father does not agree. She is finally sentenced to do three years in prison despite her father’s pleads with the court to acquit her. The film exhibits the pressures and contradictories that women of Afghanistan face today. It also shows the perilous consequences when women refuse to fit in; they are locked up in prison for perpetrating the so-called “moral crimes”. Afghanistan is a very controlled society where the assumption is that if you have run away from home, you have committed a sexual act (Eshaghian, 2011).

These acts of women are deemed as menacing to the very fabric of society in Afghanistan and their self-determination is considered as an illegal activity. Over the years after the fall of Taliban, NGOs for Afghan women have constantly worked for the betterment of women’s lives and have acquired some success on different fields but these achievements pale in comparison with the casualties that traditionalism and tribalism bring to the society. This paper has no intention of showing all the women in Afghanistan as powerless and silent; there are women like Kareema, Sabereh and Allema who broke with tradition and are in jail because of breaching the traditional rules. Therefore, ultimately, tradition has the upper hand. Even women’s right activists are always attacked by conservative and traditional leaders which have a chilling effect on all the women of Afghanistan.
who wish to have a voice and speak for their rights. Traditionalism and tribalism use Shari’a laws to treat women but there is a widespread misunderstanding of Islamic values towards women. Many Afghan men still do not know that Islam never opposes women; they are ignorant of the fact that women are not second citizen and they need to be reminded that women are not commodities and should not be exchanged for money or a piece of land. Unfortunately, the Customary and traditional rural laws rule even in Kabul, a semi-modern city. These customary laws are the backbone of laws in Kabul.

4. Reconstructing the Society through Education

12 years after the US-led intervention of Afghanistan, the struggle still persists for women today. Najmi (2012) argues that the female literacy rate in Afghanistan is 14 percent which is a saddening fact. Families, especially in rural area, still believe that girls should not go to schools. Unsurprisingly, 80 per cent of females do not have access to an education center. Tradition maintains its strong hold even with the current government. In 2009, a law was issued by the Karzai government legalizing rape within marriage and women were refused to leave their homes except for legitimate purposes (Najmi, 2012). Another discriminatory law states that women should not work or receive education without their husband’s consent. These misogynistic laws also reduce “the right of mothers to be children’s guardians in the event of divorce and makes impossible for wives to inherit their houses and land from their husbands” (Najmi, 2012, p. 1). These circumstances make it very tough for women to rise socially, politically or economically. Women cannot feel equal when they are subject to rape by their own husband. “These conditions are somewhat redolent of the abhorrent ‘Jim Crow’ laws in the US in the 1880s that restricted African Americans in every aspect of their lives” (Najmi, 2012, p. 1). Tradition makes it hard for the people of Afghanistan to be educated and it makes them ignorant of international or human rights laws. That is why the traditional leaders who are supposed to be religious are given the right to interfere in women’s rights.

Traditional attitudes cannot be erased easily as they are predominant attitudes even amongst women. Tradition inculcates women right from a young age that they are always a commodity and a second citizen; it teaches men that they are always superior figures who have each and every right to treat women like a property. Since Afghanistan is a male dominated society, the male dominance is sanctioned as natural and cultural norm. Therefore, the long standing traditional attitude of misogyny is not just confined to men; most of the Afghan women believe in the negative stereotypes about themselves; this false negativity contributes in treating them like a commodity. This is not surprising in a society where secular education barely existed and even public education is somehow considered a relatively new concept. For decades, boys received traditional or seemingly religious education and girls were prohibited education altogether but it was hammered into their head that men should be obeyed. Traditional laws are not unbreakable; both men and women of Afghanistan are in dire need of a new kind of education. Men need to be taught about humans and women's rights, and boys and girls need to be told at school that they are equal. Ahmed-Ghosh (2003) argues that to improve women’s status in Afghanistan, traditional and rural construction should be reconstructed as they are the backbone of Afghan society. She notes that since Afghanistan’s immediate concern in future is economic and since thousands of widowed, abandoned, and divorced women live in poverty, training and educating these women could produce a class of “women who would then be economically empowered. This empowerment could translate into political power, which in turn could impact the need to change women’s situation in the emerging Afghan society” (Ahmed-Ghosh, 2003, p. 11).

As a prerequisite to the advancement of Afghanistan’s education system, political and economic security is a key issue to be focused upon by the government. Government should modify its policy with regard to education and its strength should be fostered outside the capital to suppress the tribal laws which prohibit education. Then to change the traditional mindsets of the grassroots and to build up new minds, the government should recruit sophisticated teachers and dispatch them to different parts of the country to educate teachers that have low levels of education or teachers who still believe in traditional and tribal laws; many of these teachers teach gender inequality, ethnic hatred and intolerance. These teachers’ pedagogical skills should also be upgraded by exposing them to various seminars and workshops of new education and the current presentation techniques. According to (Islam, 2007, p. 8), this helps in introducing “an education system based on secularism and minimising the presence of Cold War and fundamentalist ideologies of Afghan teachers who were mostly educated in conservative and religious madrassas.” It should be noted that there is nothing wrong with religious madrassas but much to our regret, many madrassas’ teachings come from radical interpretation of Islam which later would serve as traditional and tribal laws. There are still a great number of parents in Afghanistan who oscillate to send their daughters to school due to these traditional laws. These parents are unaware of the benefits of women education.

Afghan women are an integral part of their family, community and nation. These women, who are caught in
tradition, need education to redefine their community in order to be recognized in the society. They are extremely suffering under the patriarchal society and government. It has been proven irrefutably that foreign interventions cannot repress the traditional and patriarchal rules and they cannot be constructive for women to improve their conditions. The only way to get rid of traditional and customary law is to make the people of Afghanistan understand that men and women have equal rights. Untraditional education teaches men that they should be engaged to be part of a solution for reconstructing the tribal and traditional rules. It teaches them that they should empower women and let them decide for themselves in their lives. The freedom to work, to vote, to marry and divorce should not be the rights only on papers rather authorities should make sure they happen in practice. NGOs should keep supporting women against all odds. Rostami-Provey (2003) argues that to eradicate traditionalism and to reconstruct the Afghan society, a) women should be given the opportunity to be agents of change, b) media should advocate women's rights, c) media should play a large role in breaking the taboos surrounding women, d) women should be given access to media to demand the protection of law and to have radio or television programs to discuss women related issues, and e) the media should present the role of women as leaders and paragon for other women.

For women to receive these opportunities to disentangle themselves from traditionalism, untraditional education is a “sine qua non”. However, to receive this kind of education, safety in the society should be provided by educating men which plays a momentous role in making a society secure. According to Brand Hayes and Jeffrey Sands (1997), opening schools and getting boys of the streets decreases one source of possible instability. It not only raises their hope up for the future but also it keeps them away from joining factional militias. Once implemented properly, education can serve as a source of understanding amongst genders, ethnicities, societies, nations, and cultures. It eradicates social tension and conflicts and it makes young boys less susceptible to extremist and fundamental ideas (Bush & Saltarelli, 2000). Untraditional education helps these would-be-men understand the gender equalities which in turn leads to a safe society and causes women to flourish. Then, these women could bring a change in the society in where they no longer have to suffer to be inferior. As an agent of change, these women could help eradicating the social unrest and ethnic conflict.

5. Conclusion

Afghanistan is one of the largest patriarchal societies in the world where traditional and tribal rules are still predominant. The post 9/11 US-led intervention in Afghanistan was partly justified to liberate Afghan women from the brutalities of their traditional men and patriarchal society. However, 12 years after the intervention, Afghan women must risk their lives by asking for justice, to receive education or to work outside of their domestic sphere. They are entangled in the complicated web of traditional and tribal rules. With a lot of NGOs to support women’s rights and protect them, they have not achieved much. In many parts of Afghanistan, people lack access to courts or they are not familiar with the law, and elders make decisions based on their own interpretation of Sharia and tribal laws. Even in Kabul, courts are affected by rural laws. Women are the ones that suffer much in consequence of the decisions. Even brave women and women activists cannot have much to say as they are usually attacked by the conservative and traditional leaders. They face prison if they break the taboo. What men and women of Afghanistan need is untraditional education. As the foundation of a society’s future, education should be prioritized in the government’s agendas. People of Afghanistan have to be taught the value of humans and the equality of men and women. Afghanistan cannot get rid of its negative tribal and traditional customs, unless its men become a part of solution and they should allow women to become agents of change. Media can have an enlightening role in promoting gender equality by presenting women leaders that could be paragons for ordinary women.

References


Hayes, B., & Sands, J. (1997). Non-traditional Military Responses to End Wars: Considerations for


Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/).