Logophoricity, Highlighting and Contrasting: A Pragmatic Study of Third-person Reflexives in Chinese Discourse

Lijin Liu
Editorial Office, Journal of Guangdong University of Foreign Studies, GDUFS
2 Baiyun Avenue (North), Guangzhou 510420, China
E-mail: liulj@mail.gdufs.edu.cn

Ning He
Division of Vocational Rehabilitation, State of Missouri
901 Progress Drive, Farmington, MO 63640, USA
E-mail: newpilot01@hotmail.com

Received: December 12, 2011         Accepted: December 30, 2011         Published: March 1, 2012
doi:10.5539/ells.v2n1p69             URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ells.v2n1p69

Abstract
This paper, in light of the notion of ‘minimal discourse-internal protagonist’, sets out to formulate as its analytic framework a pragmatic principle governing anaphora patterns and then explores the functions of third-person reflexives in Chinese discourse. The findings are in order. First, in Chinese, simplex reflexives are basically logophoric, whereas complex reflexives serve primarily to highlight and contrast discourse entities. Secondly, there are two types of constructions in Chinese in terms of anaphoric production: one is known as single-fold anaphora and the other as dual or multifold anaphora. And thirdly, our proposed pragmatic principle can very well capture the uses of reflexives in Chinese discourse.

Keywords: Reflexives, Anaphoric interpretation, Anaphoric production, Pragmatic principle

1. Introduction
In the light of the notion of ‘minimal discourse-internal protagonist’ (henceforth MDP for short) as proposed in e.g. Zribi-Hertz (1989) and Sells (1987), this study is to formulate a pragmatic principle controlling anaphora patterns in order to describe the functions of third-person (Note 1) long-range reflexives (hereafter ‘reflexives’ for the sake of simplicity) in Chinese discourse.

Here the MDP is, on our part, defined as a most prominent, vital entity in a given (fragment of) discourse, which is dominant in the unfolding of the discourse. As well, it is viewed as a semantic-discourse role and the deictic center of reflexives (see (8a-(ii)) below for a clear definition). The anaphoric relationship thus established between a reflexive (anaphor) and the MDP (antecedent) is known as logophoricity (Sells 1987) or logophora (Baltin 2003, Huang 2008) or logophoric anaphora (Reinhart and Reuland 1991: 312). For example, in (1) below, Chinese “ziji” in the second clause refers back to the MDP “Mingzi” in the first clause, a sort of typical logophoric anaphora. And in English, as argued in Reuland 2009, reflexive pronouns can also have logophoric uses as manifested in (2): himself in the second sentence takes as its antecedent the MDP John in the first sentence.

(1) Keshi Mingzi1 zhidao gugu hen shili, ziji1 you qiong,

but Mingzi know aunt very snobbish self yet poor
Suoyi yizhi bugan tiqi qinshi lai. (Xu Y. 2004)
therefore all the while afraid mention marriage PA
(But Mingzi1 knew that his aunt was snobbish and he1 was very poor, therefore he had been all the while afraid to mention the marriage.)

(2) John1 was furious. The picture of himself1 in the museum had been mutilated. (Reuland 2009)
Previous approaches, ‘more traditional’ to say so, like what was called ‘subject orientation’ analysis as seen in earlier syntactic literature (Huang and Tang 1991, Battelotta and Xu 1990) cannot deal with cases where the antecedent comes in non-subject position, such as objective or attributive position. Witness the examples in (3) below: antecedent “ta” (him) in (3a-b) and “Xiaoming” in (3c) are not subjects, refuting the subject-orientation approach; however, it is quite OK to treat them as MDP entities, which justifies an alternative account, say, an MDP-oriented one, to a huge extent, as will become more evident in the ensuing text.

(3) a. Zhe jian shi  gaosu ta₁  ziji₁  yiqian de xiangfa buyiding dui.  
   this CL matter tell him self former MM idea may not right (Xu L. 1997)  
   (This matter told him₁ that his₁ former idea may not be right.)

b. Zhe jian shi  shi ta₁  renshi dao ziji₁  yiqian de xiangfa buyiding dui. (ibid.)  
   this CL matter make him realize PA self former MM idea may not right  
   (This matter made him₁ realize that his₁ former idea may not be right.)

c. Mama₁ biaoyang le ziji₂₁  shi Xiaoming₂  hen gaoxing. (Huang 1994: 190)  
   Mum praise AM self make Xiaoming₂ very happy  
   (That Mum₁ praised him₂/herself₁ makes Xiaoming₂ very happy.) (Huang 1994: 190)

In the next section we will propose as the analytic framework a pragmatic principle governing anaphora patterns in Chinese discourse, hinging on the concept of MDP.

2. A pragmatic Principle

We have to describe, beforehand, the semantic strength and/or informativeness of Chinese reflexives, whereby a semantic hierarchy of reflexive versus pronoun is postulated to show their distinct semantic features. In terms of reflexive pronouns, there are two types in Chinese: simplex and complex, namely “ziji” and “Pr-ziji”. The semantic information of both types of reflexives and that of pronoun in Chinese are in order below.

(4) General semantic representation of Chinese third-person reflexive

w

NP [~ [1, 2], {Sg/Pl, Log, Em}]  
[x₁] [x₁=P]

(5) a. Semantic representation of Chinese “ziji”

ziji

NP [~ [1, 2], {Sg/Pl, +Log, +Em}]  
[x₁] [x₁ = +P]

b. Semantic representation of Chinese “Pr-ziji”

Pr-ziji

NP [~ [1, 2], {Sg/Pl, +Log, +Em}]  
[x₁] [x₁ = +P]

(6) General semantic representation of Chinese third-person pronoun

w

NP [~ [1, 2], {Sg / Pl, –Log, –Em}]  
[x₁] [x₁ = –P]

Key to the symbols/numbers: w= reflexive (or pronoun); ~ = negation of; 1=first person pronoun; 2=second person pronoun; Sg=singular; Pl=plural; Log=logophoric; Em=emphatic; x₁ = entity referred to by w (e.g. reflexive); P=NP encoding the protagonist; + = obligatorily; ± = optionally; – = lack or deprivation of (a feature).

As a reference frame, the semantic representation of Chinese pronoun is given in (6) (Note 2). So based on the descriptions above of semantic information, a semantic hierarchy of Chinese reflexive vs. pronoun (Pr for short) may be postulated in (7).

(7) ziji  =/> Pr-ziji  >  Pr

The scale in (7) says that Chinese “ziji” may be understood as semantically tantamount to “Pr-ziji” in that generally
the former is obligatorily logophoric while the latter obligatorily emphatic. On the other hand, “ziji” is deemed semantically stronger than “Pr-ziji” in that it contributes much more to discourse anaphora resolution, to the extent that it may be given more weightings due to its rich logophoricness. This greater weighting has proved to be true by the highly frequent occurrences of “ziji” in Chinese written discourse (Liu 2008a: 43).

We now propose a pragmatic principle regulating ad hoc the anaphoric and/or logophoric uses of Chinese reflexives as the analytic framework of this paper, as in (8).

(8) A pragmatic principle of discourse anaphora
a. Interpretation maxim (Note 3)
(i) In Chinese, a reflexive in a given (fragment of) discourse is generally understood as referring to the MDP, unless the particular situations in the discourse domain (e.g. co-occurrence of two or more contrasting items or speaker intending otherwise) prevent and/or alter this reading.
(ii) The MDP refers in that case to a proximate, prominent entity which is backward/left (or forward/right) accessible to the reflexive in a portion of the discourse and read as logophoric; and it is encoded as an NP or a conjoined NP.

b. Production maxim
In Chinese, where “ziji”, “Pr-ziji” and Pr can all serve to create discourse anaphora, the speaker is supposed to prioritize “ziji” to encode logophora for the purpose of saving readers’ time for discourse understanding, unless:
(i) “Pr-ziji” is required by the discourse condition (or speaker’s subjective intention) to prioritize for producing strongly contrastive/emphatic constructions; or
(ii) Pr is only permitted by the discourse condition (or speaker’s obligatory consideration) to produce an objective domain of discourse; (Note 4) or
(iii) Supplementary maxim: Where “ziji”, “Pr-ziji” and Pr serve to produce two or more than two anaphoric chains, one is supposed to use “ziji” (and/or “Pr-ziji”) to refer to MDP and use “Pr-ziji” and/or Pr to refer to other entities.
As suggested in (8b), the aforesaid principle needs to have additional constraints to become relatively perfect. According to Zribi-Hertz (1989), the use of English reflexive is in immediate connection with the narrative point of view: a subjective domain of discourse is narrated from the internal protagonist’s perspective, while an objective one from the observer’s perspective. Consider:

(9) Everything was full of the stir, the potency, the fecundity of spring.
Suddenly he said aloud: ‘Possessiveness is the devil.’
Maggie1 looked at him. Did he mean herself1—herself1 and the baby? (Zribi-Hertz 1989)
(10) The music made her1 think of her life as it seldom did; it exalted her1/*herself1. (ibid.)
In (9), herself comes within the boundary of the MDP’s point-of-view domain; that is, the (minimal) domain of discourse where the reflexive occurs is subjective and thus is transparent for it to create long-range anaphora or logophora. In (10), however, herself comes outside the boundary of the MDP’s perspective, and this domain of discourse is objective and opaque so that the reflexive is not in a position to encode logophora, and instead, it entails therein the use of a pronoun characterized by [-Log] to establish discourse coherence.
For convenience, we quote and recompose in (11) part of Zribi-Hertz’s (1989: 714) definition of subjective against objective domain of discourse and its restriction on reflexives, which count as additional constraints to the pragmatic principle in (8):

(11) a. A domain of point of view (DPV) consists of a clause category, which amounts to any phrase of subject-predicate structure, including zero-subject structure;
b. A DPV is subjective, where it contains a discourse-internal protagonist and the event or state is narrated from its point of view; and a DPV is objective, where it does not contain a discourse-internal protagonist and the event or state is described as it stands in the reality from the observer’s point of view;
c. A DPV is opaque, where it involves an independent, objective narrative point of view; otherwise, it is transparent.
As noted in (8b), in anaphoric production the subjective and objective DPV may be occasionally predicated on the speaker’s consideration: a pronoun is used where a reflexive might have been used, and vice versa. In (9), for instance, herself can be replaced by her. Under some circumstances, nonetheless, the speaker has to describe the event or state from the observer’s perspective, excluding the possibility of use of reflexive, as in (10). This
phenomenon occurs, too, in Chinese discourse, as in (12) below, which speaks volumes for the fact that the constraints stated in (11) work equally well on Chinese reflexives.

(12) Zhejiang Weishi xinwen zhubo Liang Wei1 bayue ershiwu zai chuchai
Shanghai qijian xinzangbing tufa, song yi yuan hou jing qiangjiu wuxiao qu shi.
Zhejiang Weishi fabu de fugao cheng, Liang Wei1 fabing shi, tongxing de tongshi
diyi shijian ba ta1 song dao yiyuan jinxing qiangjiu, bing diaoji Shanghai zuihao de
dian yisheng zhuanjia huizhen. … ta1 zai dang zhubo de shihou, guanzhong dou
diary very much like her we often joke her young old take-all

Discourse (12) is extracted from a Chinese news report carried in The Southern Metropolis Daily on August 30, 2009, where clearly the four occurrences of the pronoun “ta” cannot be replaced by a reflexive such as “ziji” or “taziji”, since the DPV in the discourse established by a subject NP, say, “tongshi” (colleagues) or “women” (we), is opaque for a reflexive pronoun (Note 5).

3. Interpretation of Reflexives in Chinese Discourse

In what follows, we'll account for the functions of reflexives in Chinese discourse in accordance with the above principle. Exemplar analysis shows that Chinese simplex and complex reflexives differ from one another in discourse in respect of logophoric use, semantic emphasis and/or discourse prominence.

3.1 Chinese Simplex Reflexive

Without morphologically logophoric pronouns as in some African languages, Chinese is not counted among the “pure” logophoric languages as listed in Culy (1994, cf. Huang 2000: 176). But as far as its referential use is concerned, “ziji” suffices for being a logophor in Chinese. Huang (1994: 188-198) once gave a detailed description of the uses of “ziji” in logo-centric domain, created by triggers such as speech, epistemic, psychological, and perceptional verbs. Based on our observation, “ziji” plays a similar, primary role in both logophoric domain and ordinary indirect discourse, referring to the MDP; and as a consequence it may well be defined as a logophor. The semantic features it carries are given in (5a): obligatorily logophoric, and optionally emphatic or contrastive. Compare:

(13) a. Hung-chien1 xiangxin Su Wen-wan yiding jiayou jiajiang, shuo ziji1 yinyou ta,
     Hung-chien believe Su Wen-wan surely exaggerate say self lure her
     wen ta, zhubei ju shi fanbo. (Note 6)
     kiss her be prepared with fact counter
     (Hung-chien, was sure Su Wen-wan had exaggerated everything; saying he1 had lured her and kissed her; and he
     was prepared to counter lies with facts.)

b. Su Xiaojie1 zhidao ta zai kan ziji, hui lian dui ta weixiao, Hung-chien
    Su Xiaojie know he AM look at self turn face to him smile Hung-chien
    yao dikang zhe meili de juexin, xiang chushui de yu, want resist this seductive force MM determination like out-of-water RM fish
tou wei zai di shang paidong, keshi zhengzha bu qi.
head tail on ground LOC flap but jump up not PA

(She knew he had his eyes on her and turned to smile at him. His determination to resist this seductive force was like a fish out of water which flaps its head and tail about on the ground but can’t get anywhere.)

(14) a. San Xiangu jian Er Zhuge laopo yijing bugu le ming, ziji xian danqie le jifen, bu gan
Third Fairy see Blacky’s wife really ignore PA life, self first frightened PA a bit not dare
lian zhan, shao nao le yihui, zhengtuo chulai jiu zou le.
keep quarreling less quarrel PA a while break away at once leave AM

(When Third Fairy saw that Blacky’s wife was really out for her blood, she became a bit frightened and broke away.)

b. Ta ben xiang zao gei Xiaoqin zao ge pojia tui chu men qu,
she originally want early for Xiaoqin get CL boyfriend’s family get her out of house PA
keshi yinwei ziji mingsheng bu zheng, chabuduo dou bu yuan yi gen ta jieqin.
But because self reputation not good almost all not want with her become related.

(For some time she had been thinking of marrying Qin off and getting her out of the house. But her own reputation was so bad; no family wanted to become related to her.)

(15) a. Alexander de hushing yue lai yue xiang, ‘te-lu’ yisheng, ba ziji xiaxing le:
Alexander MM snoring more and more loud, ‘te-lu’ snoring BA self wake AM
“Shui dahu laizhe?”
who snore AU

(Alexander’s snoring grew so loud that it woke him up; startled, he blinked, “Who’s that?”)

b. Zhe zhen rang Xiangzi de xin tiao de kuai le xie! Zhen yao
cou shang san si shi kuai, zai jiashang Liu Siye shouli na
collect PA thirty-forty CL again plus Fourth Master Liu in-hand that
sanshi duo, he ziji xianzai you de na ji kuai, qibu jiushi bashi lai de?
thirty over and self now have RM that a few CL wouldn’t just eighty over PA

(These words made his heart thump. He thought that if thirty or forty yuan could be collected from such a group, together with the thirty yuan kept by Fourth Master Liu and the little bit of money he himself had, that would come to over eighty dollars, wouldn’t it?)

(16) a. Zhe zhong taidu shi ta zhi gu ziji de shenghuo, ba yiqiehuohuan zainan
dou bangzai nao hou.
this CL attitude make him only think of self MM livelihood BA all calamities

all put out of mind
(This attitude of his made him think only of his own livelihood. He pushed all thought of calamities out of his mind.)

b. Sun Xiaojie de lianhong huran shi ta xiangqi zai Faguosh i
Sun Xiaojie MM blushing face suddenly remind him think of in France time
fan shang chong jiu de liangshui; ziji buhui hejiu, zhi zai shui li
rice LOC add wine RM cold water self cannot drink just in water LOC
chong yidiandian hongjiu, chang kan zhe hong yeti zai bai yeli li
add a little red wine often watch this red liquid in white liquid LOC
fanbu-aidai, zuochu yunwu zhuangtai ...
diffuse turn into nebulous state
(Miss Sun’s blushing face suddenly reminded him of the cold water on the tables in France for fixing drinks. Since he couldn’t drink, he would just add a little red wine to the water, watching the red liquid diffuse in the white liquid. …)

Examples of (13a-b) are two logophoric constructions triggered by the epistemic verbs “xiangxin” (believe) and “zhidao” (know); and there the reflexives come in the object clause. By (8a), the reflexives in these two discourses are understood as referring to MDP entities: in (13a) “ziji” is coreferential with “Hung-chien”; encoded as matrix subject; and in (13b) it is coreferential with Miss Su, which is encoded also as matrix subject.

All examples in (14a)-(16b) are what can be called ordinary narrative discourses without logophoric verbs or triggers, in each of which the reflexive has to be understood by (8a) to refer to the MDP in question as well. In (14a-b) the MDP entity, encoded as subject of the first sentence, is naturally the most prominent noun phrase, so the two “ziji” are construed by (8a) as coreferential with “San Xiangu” (Third Fairy) and “ta” (she) respectively. Note that in (14b) “Xiao Qin” intervening between the reflexive and its antecedent does not invalidate long-distance anaphora, sufficing to indicate the logophoric role “ziji” plays in discourse.

In (15a), “Alexander” the MDP is encoded as attributive of the matrix subject; in (15b), “Xiangzi” the MDP is encoded as attributive of the embedded subject; and both are the prominent entity accessible to “ziji” in the discourse.

In (16a-b), both MDPs are actualized by the pronoun “ta” (he) in object position. In (16a), “ta” is the only eligible antecedent of “ziji”; and as an attribute, the reflexive here is not a so-called local anaphor since it may be replaced by “ta”. Viewed from the encoder/speaker, however, the choice of “ziji” fits in with production maxim (8b): where reflexive “ziji” and pronoun “ta” can both serve to establish discourse anaphora, the speaker is supposed to prioritize the reflexive to encode logophora to save time for discourse understanding. And the anaphora pattern in (16b) is in a long sentence or cross-sentence construction and “ziji”, which acts as subject of the second clause, is interpreted as coreferential with “ta”, the object of the verb “shi”, (reminded) in the preceding sentence.

3.2 Chinese Complex Reflexive

As seen in (5b), the semantics of complex reflexive “Pr-ziji” differs from that of simplex reflexive “ziji” in that its logophoric use is optional, not obligatory; but its emphatic use is obligatory. Instantiations in discourse show that “Pr-ziji” may be analyzed as an emphatic or intensive expression of pronoun, serving primarily to highlight and contrast entities in the establishment of discourse coherence (Baker 1995). Both uses of “tamenziji” (themselves) in (17) below, for example, can be understood as an intensive item of “tamen” (them), not referring to “shou guo hai de ren” (peasants who suffered a lot), but referring to “ta liangren” (they both) nearby, with “minbing” (militiamen) and “minfu” (villagers) intervening in between. Similarly in (18) “taziji” (herself) refers back to “San Nainai” (Third Daughter-in-law), with “gongpo” (her father-in-law) intervening in between, and the narrator makes use of “taziji” to highlight the entity referred to; however one can substitute “ziji” for it so as to reduce its salience or emphaticness and suggest its logophoric reference.

(17) Ta yi shuo kaile tou, xuduo shou guo hai de ren ye dou
he once begin speaking up many suffer AM harm RM people also all
qiangzhe shuo qilai: you gei tamen hua guo qian de, you bei
try first speak PA some PM them blackmail AM money PA some PM
tamen bizhe shang guo diao de; ta liangren shai pai shang minbing
them drive commit AM suicide PA they both also send PA militiamen
gei tamenziji ge chai, bo shang minfu gei tamenziji chu di;
for themselves cut firewood order PA villager for themselves hoe field
fu shou liang, si pai kuan, qiangpo minbing kun ren.
confiscate grain impose taxes order militiamen arrest people
(That broke the ice. Peasants rose one after another to expose the wickedness of Xing and Wang—blackmail, driving people to suicide. ... They, sent militiamen out to cut their, firewood; they, ordered villagers to hoe their, fields. They confiscated grain, imposed taxes, and used the militia as their private police.)

(18) San Nainai qiao gongpo yao taziji lingzhe haizi, yi kou
Third Daughter-in-law see father-in-law expect herself look after baby one CL
menqi   zhang de duzi  dou jianjian da le, chi dongxi mei weikou,  
pent-up resentment swell AU stomach even gradually big PA eat things have no appetite 
sizhi fali,  qing yi fu yao,  tongshi Ah Hsiung zhi neng you popo  
limbs grow weak call doctor take medicine meanwhile Ah Hsiung only can PM grandma  
bangzhe dialing.  
help take care of  
(Seeing that her father-in-law expected her to take care of the baby herself, Third Daughter-in-law’s pent-up resentment swelled and so did her stomach, while her appetite diminished and her limbs grew weak. The doctor was called in and she was given some medicine. Meanwhile Ah Hsiung became the sole charge of his grandmother.)  
By contrast, in the following discourses “Pr-ziji” and its antecedent are separated obviously farther away: the two reside in different sentences.  
(19) Lao Tong Bao1 suiran bu hen jide    zufu  shi zenyang “zuoren”, dan fuqin de qinjian  
Old Tong Bao although not very recall grandpa be what sort of man but father MM diligence  
zhonghou,ta1 shi qinyan kanjian de; taziji1 ye shi guiju  ren, …  
honesty he just with his own eyes see PA himself also be respectable man  
(Although Old Tong Bao1 couldn’t recall what sort of man his grandfather was, he knew his father had been hardworking and honest—he had seen that with his own eyes. Old Tong Bao himself was a respectable person; …)  
(20) Lao Tong Bao1 tai qi ta na  jiaohuang de zhou lian,    kunao de wang zhe  
Old Tong Bao raise PA his that sallow MM shrunken face, bitterly MM gaze AM  
ta mianqian de na tiao he, he li de chuan, yiji liangan de sang di.  
his front MM that CL river river LOC MM boat and both bank MM mulberry field  
Yiqie dou he ta3 ershi duo sui shi chabuliao duoshao, ran’er “shijie” daodi  
all entirely and he twenty over year time almost the same but world anyway  
bian le. Taziji1 jia ye yao changcheg ba zaliang dang fan chi yi tian.  
change AM his own family also have to often BA pumpkin as rice eat one day  
(Old Tong Bao1 raised his shrunken face, scorched by years of hot sun to the color of dark parchment. He gazed bitterly at the canal before him, at the boats on its waters, at the mulberry trees along its banks. All were approximately the same as they had been when he was twenty. But the world had changed. His family now often had to make their meals of pumpkin instead of rice.)  
(21) Yang guizi zenyang jiu pian  le qian  qu, Lao Tong Bao1 bu hen mingbai. Dan ta1  
foreign devil how just scam AM money PA Old Tong Bao not very clear but he  
hen xiangxin Lao Chen Laoye de hua yiding bu cuo. Bingqie taziji, ye mingmingkandao  
very believe Old Master Chen MM word surely right and yet himself also quite plain see  
zicong zhenshang you le yang sha, yang bu, yang you, zhe yi lei  
since market town appear PA foreign cambric foreign cloth foreign oil one this CL  
yang huo, erqie he li geng you le xiao huolunchuan yihou, taziji1  
foreign goods yet canal LOC even appear PA small foreign boat after his own  
tian li shengchu lai de dongxi jiu yi tian yi tian bu zhiqian, er zhenshang de  
field LOC grow PA RM things suddenly day by day not worth money and market town MM  
dongxi que yi tian yi tian gui qilai.  
things yet day by day expensive PA  
(How the foreign devils had accomplished this, Old Tong Bao1 wasn’t too clear. He was sure, however, that Old Master Chen was right. Some things he himself had seen quite plainly. From the time foreign goods—cambric, cloth, oil—appeared in the market town, from the time the foreign river boats increased on the canal, what he produced brought a lower price in the market every day, while what he had to buy became more and more
expensive.)
In (19), “taziji” (himself) in the last clause is coreferential with “ta” (he, viz. Old Tong Bao) in the preceding clause. In (20), “taziji” (in the last sentence) and its antecedent are separated by a subject-predicate structure; in other words, the antecedent comes two clauses backward in the discourse. In (21), “taziji” is used twice: the first is separated from its antecedent by one intervening (embedded) clause, and the second is much farther away from its antecedent. In those discourses, “taziji” is used to emphasize and highlight the MDP entities, each of which is in contrast with its concomitant, namely, “fuqin” (father) in (19), “shijie” (world) in (20) and “Lao Chen Laoye” (Old Master Chen) in (21). Consider another instance:

(22) Hsin-mei he Hung-chien yi ye zai huoche li mei shui hao, hui fang tangzhe
Hsin-mei and Hung-chien the whole night on train LOC not sleep well return room lie
xiuxi, Li Mei-ting da men jinlai le, wen you shenme hao dongxi gei ta kan.
rest Li Mei-ting knock door enter AM ask have what fine things show him
Liangren lan qichuang, jiao taziji (ta /*ziji) kan qiangbi shang de wenxian.
both of them not feel like getting up let himself (him/self) look at wall LOC MM graffiti
(Hsin-mei and Hung-chien hadn’t slept well the whole night on the train, so they returned to their rooms to rest. Li2 knocked on the door and entered, asking them what wonderful things they had to show him. Neither of them1 felt like getting up, so they let him2 look at the wall graffiti by himself.)

Example (22) shows us more clearly the distinction between complex and simplex reflexive in Chinese: “liangren” (they both, namely Hsin-mei and Hung-chien) acts as the MDP in the current sentence where the reflexive appears; yet “taziji” is supposed to be understood as coreferential with “Li Mei-ting” in the prior sentence in the discourse; and therefore “taziji” may not be replaced by “ziji” though it can be replaced by a pronoun “ta”. It is thus evidenced that a Chinese complex reflexive serves basically as an intensifier or highlighter in discourse.

All those discussed above are depicted by the pragmatic maxims stated in (8a-(i)) and/or (8b).

4. Chinese Reflexives in Anaphoric Production

Discourse anaphoric interpretation and production are two sides of a coin and can mirror one another. In what follows, we are to discuss and show from the perspective of speaker the fact that anaphoric production in Chinese discourse can be as well predicted and accounted for by our pragmatic principle.

The examples to describe the regular anaphora patterns in Chinese come from the data collected from both Chinese novels and English-Chinese translated novels. Analysis of these attested examples indicates that there are by and large two types of anaphoric production modes in Chinese discourse.

4.1 Single-fold Anaphora

The first type is referred to as single-fold anaphoric construction, which divides into three anaphoric patterns. They are characterized in order below.

Anaphoric pattern A: in a given (minimal) discourse where an NP (including pronoun, hereinafter inclusive) introduces the MDP, use or repeat using “ziji” (x) to encode and maintain this anaphoric relationship thus set up. The pattern is schematized in (23) and exemplified in (24)-(25).

(23) NP1 ... x1 ... (x1) ...
(24) a. Ma Xiansheng1 zai Lundun san si ge yue su de de jingyan, bing bu suan
Ma Mr. in London three-four CL month AU obtain RM experience can’t be said
hen duo: zhaozhe le san si ge xiao Zhongguo fanpu, tiantian qu chi dun wufan.
a lot find AM three-four CL small Chinese restaurant every day go eat CL lunch
Ziji1 neng buyong Ma Wei1 ling zhe, you puzi zou hui jia qu.
self may not need Ma Wei accompany AM from shop walk back home PA
(Mr. Ma1 couldn’t really be said to have seen or done a lot in the three or four months that he’d been in London. He’d found a few Chinese restaurants where he would go for his daily lunch. And he1 could find his way around without having Ma Wei; he usually walked home from the shop.)
b. Ta1 xihuan nanfang, bingqie ziji yiwei hen kuai jiu cheng le nanfang ren.
he like South and self suppose very soon then become AM Southerner

76
(He, liked the South, and he soon became, in his own, opinion, a Southerner.)

(25) a. Ta wuqing de, yixin yiyi de zhuiqiu yi ge mubiao, jiushi yao yongyou

(With a ruthless singleness of purpose, he, desired his own, house, his own, plantation, his own, horse, and his own, slaves.)

b. Fang Hung-chien mul a while suspect Irishman undoubtedly AM play trick

(Fang1 mulled it over for a while, suspecting that the Irishman was undoubtedly up to tricks. If he1 bought a bogus diploma and went back to dupe other people with it, wouldn’t he himself be a fraud? … Since both his father and his father-in-law hoped he, would become a Ph.D., how could he, a son and son-in-law, dare disappoint them? Buying a degree to deceive them was like purchasing an official rank in Manchu times, or like the merchants of a British colony contributing a few ten thousand pound notes to the royal exchequer in exchange for a knighthood, he reasoned. Every dutiful son and worthy son-in-law should seek to please his elders by bringing glory to the family. In any case, when later it came time for him, to look for a job, he would never include this degree in his resume. He might as well try slashing the price, and if the Irishman refused, he, could then forget the whole thing and avoid turning into a fraud himself.)

In each of the examples in (24), there is just one logophoric linkage encoded by “ziji”; and in the discourses of (25), “ziji” occurs in succession, forming an anaphoric/logophoric chain.

The anaphoric pattern in (23) has a variant, shown in (26): “ziji” is prepositioned so that a cataphoric pattern is made, namely, it is the case that the MDP comes forward (right) in the discourse. Such anaphoric patterns are more often than not observed to appear in complex or compound sentence constructions (like one with an independent clause followed or preceded by a dependent clause), including those conveying various logical relationships between the two clauses, such as temporal, cause-effect, condition-action, topic-comment, as shown in (27a-c).
as if each CL word totally by his entire personality be certified

In order to cover his stuttering, Han spoke little, slowly and with great effort, as though each word carried with it the weight of his entire personality.)

b. Mo zhe ziji de xiba, Shang Huizhang, you xiao le yi xiao, stroke self Merchants Guild head again smile one smile

lean body say

(Stroking his chin, the head of the Merchants Guild smiled and leaned towards Mr. Lin, saying …)

c. Zhiyu ziji jial de suoxie, ta zhidao Hung-chien juebu hui xiang as for family trifles she know Hung-chien never willto

Fangjia qu jiang, zhe yi dian she xiangxin de guo.

Fangs’s family talk one point trust AU PA

(As for her own family’s trifles, she knew Hung-chien would never speak of them to the Fangs. Of that she could be sure.)

Anaphoric pattern B: in a given discourse where an NP introduces the MDP, alternately use “ziji” (x) and/or “Pr-ziji” (Pr-x) and/or Pr to encode and maintain this anaphoric linkage thus created. The pattern is schematized in (28).

(28) NP₁ … x₁/Pr-x₁/Pr₁ … x₁/Pr-x₁/Pr₁… (x₁/Pr-x₁/Pr₁…)

The anaphoric pattern in (28) says that when an NP (often lexical/full NP) is entered into the discourse, one may optionally make use of these three referential elements to establish and maintain the anaphoric relationship, and that the parenthesized link(s) is (are) optional (similar hereinafter). Thus as observed in the ensuing discourses, the anaphoric pattern in (29a) assumes an ‘NP₁--x₁--Pr₁’ sequence; the one in (29b) ‘NP₁--Pr-x₁--Pr-x₁--x₁’; and the one in (29c) ‘NP (Pr₁)--Pr-x₁--Pr-x₁--Pr’.

(29) a. San Xiangu qixian hai yiwei ziji reng you gouyin qingnian de benling,

Third Fairy at first still think self still have lure young man ability
days long young man PL not at all really to her come close

(Third Fairy as first thought her own charm was the cause. But gradually she saw it was the young men who were not really interested in her.)

b. Darcy suoyi xihuan Bingley, shi yinwei Bingley weiren wenrou dunhou,

Darcy hence love Bingley be because Bingley behave gentle honest
tanbai zhishuang, jin’guan gexing fangmian he taziji, open frank though disposition aspect with himself extremely in contrast and himself

eye conglaibu ceng juede ziji, de gexing you shenme bu wanmei de defang.

also never ever think self MM character have any not perfect MM point

(Bingley was endeared to Darcy by the easiness, openness, ductility of his temper, though no disposition could offer a greater contrast to his own, and though with his own, he never appeared dissatisfied.)

c. Ta shuo: hun le yibeizi er mei chu guo jingmen, daodi suan bu liao yingxiong,

he say live AM all life but not leave AM capital after all be not PA capable man

chengzhe hai you kou qi’er, qudao ge chu jianshi jianshi. Buguan zenyang, ta ziji, while still have CL breath come to various place have a look anyway himself

ye mei lian zai chengli hun, yinwei ziji de nü’er gei ta diu le ren.

also feel shameless in town stay because self MM daughter make him lose PA face

(If he never in his life left the capital, he said, he couldn’t pride himself on being a man. While he still had breath in
him he ought to have a look round. Anyway, he was ashamed to stay in town after his daughter had disgraced him completely.)

Anaphoric pattern C: in a given discourse where an NP is used to introduce the MDP, alternately use “Pr-ziji” (Pr-x) and/or Pr to set up and/or maintain the anaphoric linkage thus created. Such an anaphoric pattern is given in (30), and it is exemplified by the discourses in (31). In (31a) the pattern is in ‘NP1--Pr1--Pr-x1’ sequence and in (31b) it is in ‘NP1--Pr1--Pr-x1--Pr1--Pr-x1’ sequence. The patterns described as such would be on a par with the prediction made by the pragmatic maxims in (8b-(i)/(ii)). That is, the anaphora pattern in (30) is triggered by the speaker’s narration from an objective point of view and/or motivation to give emphasis and prominence to discourse entities.

(30) NP1 … Pr-x1/Pr1 … (Pr-x1/Pr1…)

(31) a. Jane1 xinli you le kuaihuo de shiqing, xianglai bu yinman Elizabeth, yushi ta1 Jane in mind have PA pleasant MM thing always not keep from Elizabeth hence she mashang baozhu meimei, jiqi reqing de chengren taziji1 shi tianxia instantly embrace sister extremely lively MM acknowledge herself be in world zui xingfu de ren. most happy MM person

(Jane1 could have no reserves from Elizabeth, where confidence would give pleasure; and (she1) instantly embracing her, acknowledged, with the liveliest emotion, that she1 was the happiest creature in the world.)

b. Keshi, guanyu tamen dinghun de yaochuan, jiujing you shenme genju ne? Zhe zhen but regarding their engagement MM rumor at all have what evidence RQM This really jiao Elizabeth, wucong xiangxiang, houmai ta1 cai xiang qile Darcy jiu let Elizabeth have no way imagine later she only recollect PA Darcy old Bingley de hao pengyou, taziji1 shi Jane de meimei, er muqian dajia Bingley MM good friend herself be Jane MM sister and now everybody wangwang hui yinwei yi chong hunyin er liandai xiangdiao zai jie yi chong generally will because one CL wedding yet together think of again have one CL hunyin, name, renmen ziran yao shengchu zhe zhong niantou laile. Taiziji1 wedding then people naturally hope supply this CL idea PA herself ye zao jiu xiang dao jiejie jiehun yihou, ta1 he Darcy jianmiande also beforehand feel PA sister marry afterward she and Darcy meet RM jihui ye jiu geng duo le. Yinci Lujianzhuang de linju men jing chance also at once even more PA therefore Lucas lodge MM neighbor PL at all ba zhe jian shi kancheng shi na jiu wen, erqie haosi jiu zai yanqian, keshi taziji1 BA this CL matter set down as almost certain and as if just immediate but herself zhibuguo juede zhe jian shi jianglai you dian xiwan eryi. only think this CL matter at future time have a little hope and nothing more

(But from what the report of their engagement could originate, Elizabeth1 was at a loss to imagine; till she1 recollected that his being the intimate friend of Bingley, and her, being the sister of Jane, was enough, at a time when the expectation of one wedding made everybody eager for another, to supply the idea. She1 had not herself1 forgotten to feel that the marriage of her sister must bring them1 more frequently together. And her neighbors at Lucas lodge, therefore, had only set that down as almost certain and immediate, which she1 had looked forward to as possible at some future time.)

4.2 Multifold Anaphora

The second type is referred to as dual or multifold anaphoric construction—different anaphoric chains made by two or more than two referring expressions which are disjoint in reference from one another. In some context of the discourse where two or more anaphoric chains are needed to construct, there is normally a distinct divide in the
co-occurrences of the three referential elements in question, making up four situations: generally, (i) “ziji” (x) is used to refer to (the) MDP (entity) and a pronoun (Pr) other entity; (ii) “ziji”’ (x) is used to refer to MDP and “Pr-ziji” (Pr-x) other entity; (iii) “Pr-ziji”’ (Pr-x) is used to refer to MDP and a pronoun (Pr) other entity or entities. The anaphora patterns corresponding to those four situations are schematized in (32a-d), where NP1 stands for the antecedent encoding MDP, and NP2 (NP3, etc.) stands for other antecedent (or antecedents) encoding other entity (or entities).

(32) a. NP1 … x1… vs. NP2… Pr2…
b. NP1 … x1… vs. NP2… Pr-x2…
c. NP1 … Pr-x1… vs. NP2… Pr2…
d. NP1 … x1 … vs. NP2… Pr-x/Pr2… (vs. (NP3… Pr-x/Pr3…))

Having got the patterns in (32) instantiated, it will be then natural for us to make it clearer that in Chinese discourse, (i) where “ziji” and a pronoun concur, the former is used to refer to MDP and the latter other entity, as in (33a); (ii) where “ziji”’ and “Pr-ziji” concur, the former is used to refer to MDP whereas the latter other entity, as in (33b); (iii) where “Pr-ziji” and a pronoun concur, the former is used to refer to MDP while the latter other entity, as in (33c); (iv) where “ziji”’ and “Pr-ziji”’ / a pronoun (or alongside a third “Pr-ziji”’/pronoun) concur, the former is utilized to refer to MDP and the latter (or a third item) other entity (or a third entity), as in (33d).

(33) a. Jane MM disease still not appear improve Elizabeth closely MM company her until to evening see her asleep AM then set as rest PA mind feel self should go downstairs PA one time

(She2 was still very poorly, and Elizabeth1 would not quit her2 at all till late in the evening, when she1 had the comfort of seeing her2 asleep, and when it appeared to her rather right than pleasant that she1 should go downstairs herself1.)

b. Xiangzi1 be like PM one CL windchoke downward successive swallow AM several air Fourth Master Liu and Harmony Yard MM pullers all think self be after money
c. Lydia1 que wanquan meiyou ba baba de hua dang yi hui shi, haihui jiezhe shuo love Carter Captain also hope that day can with him meet because he next morning just will go to London PA

(Lydia1, with perfect indifference, continued to express her1 admiration of Captain Carter2, and her hope of seeing...
him in the course of the day, as he was going the next morning to London.)

d. Gao Song-nian, learn of it hurry over to teacher dormitory give greeting once return to office
yi yue lai de xinshi bu neng zai ge zai yibian bu xiang le. Zicong Changsha

one month since MM matter can no longer put aside not meditate since Changsha
weiji, pin hao de jiaoshou li shi ge daoyou jiu ge dadianbao lai tuo gu
crisis hire PA RM professor of ten CL yet nine CL send telegram PA on pretext
jie yue, qi ling ba Luo, kai bu chu ban, xing’er xuesheng ye shou zhanshi yingxiang,
cancel contrast topsy-turvy cannot begin class luckily students also get war influence
zhiyou 158 ren. Jintian yi lai jiu shi si ge jiaoshou, junrong da zhen,
only 158 student today at once arrive exactly four CL professor real boost to morale
xiang buli bao shang ye timian xie. Zhishi zenyang dui Li Mei-ting
to Education Ministry report PA also look better a little but how to Li Mei-ting
he Fang Hung-chien jieshi ne? Buli Wang Cizhang jieshao
and Fang Hung-chien explain RQM Education Ministry Wang Vice-minister recommend
Wang Chu-hou lai dang Zhongguo Wenxuezi zhuren, ziji 1 zao xiixin pin
Wang Chu-hou PA be Chinese Literature Department chairman self already write appoint
ing Li Mei-ting2 liao, keshi Wang Chu-hou shi Wang Cizhang de bofu, lun
definite Li Mei-ting PA but Wang Chu-hou be Wang Vice-minister MM uncle regarding
zige ye bi Li Mei-ting hao, na shihou gei jiaoshou luxu chi pin de qualification also than Li Mei-ting better that time PM professor successive decline appointment RM
dianbao xia hun le tou, pa Shanghai zhe pi ren hui da hui piao,
telegram scare stunned PA head afraid Shanghai this group people will turn back halfway
zhiaoh xian fuyan Cizhang. Wang Chu-hou zhe ren bu hao dafa, Li Mei-ting2 shi lao
only first humor Vice-minister Wang Chu-hou this man not easily handle Li Mei-ting be old
pengyou, lao pengyou zong jiang de kai, jiu pa ta2 de piqi nan duifu!
friend old friend always be brought around just worry his MM temper hard deal with
Zhe xing Fang de nian qing ren dao rongyi duifu de. Ta3 shi Chao Xin-mei de laitou,
this young Fang fellow should easy handle PA he be Chao Xinmei MM friend
Xin-mei zuichu bu ken lai, jieshao le ta3, shuo ta3 shi liuxue Deguo
Xin-mei at first not want come recommend PA him say he be study abroad Germany
de boshi, zhen hutu tou ding! Taziji3 kai lai de xueli, bing meiyou xuewei,
RM doctor real nonsense absolutely himself send PA RM resume yet have no degree
zhi shi ge ge guo langdang de liuxuesheng, bingtie bingfei xue zhengzhi de, only be CL various country dissipate RM student drifter and even never study politics RM
pin ta3 dang jiaoshou tai yuanwangle! Zhiduo zuo fu jiaoshou, xun xu jian jin,
hire him as professor too unjust PA at most start as associate prof. work up step by step
nian qing ren chu zuo shi bu yinggai pa de tai gao, zhe hua keyi jiao Xin-mei
young people first do job shouldn’t climb AU too high this can have Xin-mei
dui ta3 shuo. Weinan de hai shi Li Mei-ting2, Wulunruhe, ta2 qian xin wan ku lai le,
to him say difficult MM still be Li Mei-ting in any case he thru many hardship come PA
juebu hui yi fanlian jiu zou de; lai de kunnan, qu ye mei name
never will just break off mad leave immediately PA come AU difficult leave also not so
rongyi, kong kou yunxu ta\textsubscript{2} xie haochu jiu shi le. Ta\textsubscript{2} cong sili xuexiao
easy empty make him some promise let it go at that he from private school
yi tiao er jin gongli xuexiao, hai bu shi ziji\textsubscript{1} tiba ta\textsubscript{2} de; zuo ren zong yao
one leap yet to national university yet not be self help him one have to
you liangxin.
show gratitude.

(Kao hurried over to the faculty dormitory to greet them; then returned to his office, no longer able to dismiss
matter that had been troubling him for the past month. Since the crisis at Changsha, nine out of ten professors he
hired had sent telegrams canceling their contracts on one pretext or another. Everything was topsy-turvy and many
classes had to be canceled; fortunately, the war had affected the students also, and only 158 of them had shown up.
Having four professors arrive at once was a real boost to his morale, and it would look a little better when he
wrote a report to the Ministry of Education. But how was he to explain things to Li Mei-ting and Fang Hung-chien?
Vice-minister Wang of the Ministry of Education had recommended Wang Chu-hou to be chairman of the
Department of Chinese Literature. Meanwhile he\textsubscript{1} had already written and appointed Li Mei-ting\textsubscript{2} to the post—but
Wang Chu-hou was Vice-minister Wang’s uncle and for that reason was better qualified than Li Mei-ting. The
succession of telegrams from professors declining appointments at that time had put his head in a spin. Afraid that
the group from Shanghai would turn back halfway, he decided he had better humor Vice-minister Wang first. He felt
Wang Chu-hou could not be easily handled, while Li Mel-ting\textsubscript{2} was an old friend and as such could always be
brought around. He\textsubscript{1} was worried that Li’s\textsubscript{2} temper would be hard to deal with. Very hard indeed! That young Fang
fellow\textsubscript{3}, on the other hand, should be easy to handle. Fang\textsubscript{3} was a friend of Chao Hsin-mei. Not wanting to come
himself, Hsin-mei had at first recommended Fang\textsubscript{3}, saying Fang\textsubscript{3} was a returned student with a doctorate from
Germany. What absolute nonsense that was! According to the resume sent by Fang himself\textsubscript{3}, Fang had no degree at
all and was nothing but a student drifter who had led a life of dissipation in one country after another. Furthermore,
Fang had never even studied political science. To hire Fang\textsubscript{3} as a professor would be an injustice! At the most Fang
could start as an associate professor and work his way up step by stop. Young people shouldn’t climb too high in
their jobs. He could have Hsin-mei tell Fang\textsubscript{3} that. The difficult still lay with Li Mei-ting\textsubscript{2}. In any case, Li\textsubscript{1} had been
through hell and high water to get here, so Li certainly wouldn’t just break off mad leave immediately. Since getting
here had been so difficult, leaving wouldn’t be so easy either. He\textsubscript{1} would make Li\textsubscript{2} some empty promises and let it
go at that. After all, wasn’t it through his\textsubscript{1} influence that Li\textsubscript{2} had made it from a private school to a national
university in one leap? One had to show some gratitude.)

To summarize, those textual examples evince a nearly undeniable pragmatic theorem: all other conditions being
equal, in the production of dual/multifold discourse anaphor a in Chinese, the speaker (writer/translator) almost
tends to use “ziji” to refer to the MDP, and use the other two reference forms (i.e. complex reflexive and
pronoun) to refer to other entities in the discourse. This phenomenon results from the fact that “ziji” does nearly
always serve to be logophoric in discourse (Liu 2008b: 34-35). Those anaphoric production modes so far discussed
can be all captured by the supplementary maxim of production, stated in (8b-(iii)).

5. Concluding Remarks

As seen from this article, we have formulated as our analytic framework a pragmatic principle capturing anaphora
patterns in discourse, in light of some relevant theoretical notion in the literature; and with it we have described ad
hoc the functions of third-person reflexives in Chinese. Our detailed description and analysis shows that in Chinese
discourse, a simplex reflexive basically functions logophorically whereas a complex one, which is treated as an
intensive item of pronoun, serves primarily to highlight and contrast entities in the discourse.

Our discussion further shows that there are two types of anaphoric production modes: one bears a single anaphoric
chain and the other bears two or more than two anaphoric chains. It can be inferred from the study that the anaphora
patterns in Chinese are very possibly more complicated than those in English since there is a system of simplex and
complex reflexive in Chinese. Overall, the anaphoric interpretation and production in Chinese discourse can be
effectively captured by the pragmatic principle proposed in this paper.

Abbreviations

The abbreviations below are used in the glosses of the Chinese examples.

AM aspectual marker
AU auxiliary: e.g. de used after a verb/adjective as in a resultative clause, suo used before a verb in an
attributive clause indicating the head is patient, or laizhe used after the predicate indicating what has just
happened

BA  the causative preposition ba in ba-construction
CL  classifier
LOC  locative
MM  modifier marker: de (including possessive de)
PA  particle: e.g. lai, qi or qilai used after a verb indicating starting to do something; guo used after the auxiliary de (as in ‘v + de + guo’), and hao / shang / qu after a verb, indicating completing some action; de, dao, diao, le, liao (as in ‘v + bu + liao’) or qilai after a verb (or adjective), or laile used at the end of a sentence, indicating the result of an action
PL  plural
PM  passive marker: including bei, gei and you
RM  relativized marker
RQM  rhetorical question marker

References


Notes

Note 1. We do not include in principle first and second person reflexives in this article, given the fact that most linguists tend to take a negative view of the endophoric/anaphoric use of first and second person pronouns including reflexives. For example, Hoeksema and Napoli (1990: 422) note that first and second person pronouns are always interpreted deictically. Also, Halliday and Hasan (1976: 18) and Halliday and Matthiessen (2004: 551) claim that – “first and second person pronouns as speech roles of speaker and addressee, are typically exophoric and secondarily anaphoric (speaker and addressee in quoted speech); … This type of reference we call EXOPHORA, since it takes us outside the text altogether. Exophoric reference is not anaphoric, since it does not bind the two elements together into a text.”

Note 2. Given the complexities in actual discourse, in this paper we do not consider the case of ‘zero pronoun’.

Note 3. We acknowledge that part of the interpretation maxims in (8a) is adapted from Zribi-Hertz’s (1989) “discourse principle”, despite the fact that there is not at all any complete, mechanical clone made of the latter.

Note 4. A comparison of the semantic information given in (5a)/(5b)/(6) obviously shows that: a) “Pr-ziji” is richer in contrastive and emphatic information than “ziji”; b) a pronoun carries the feature [-Log], suggesting that its use is motivated by an objective point of view taken by the speaker in narration.

Note 5. Besides, we argue that there is a stricter restriction, the so-called ‘animacy’ and/or ‘consciousness’ constraint, on the use of reflexives: as antecedent, any MDP entity is supposed to be animate or conscious. In this discourse, “Liang” as MDP is now an inanimate entity, disallowing use of a reflexive.