George Town World Heritage Site: What We Have and What We Sell?

Banafsheh M. Farahani¹, Gelareh Abooali¹ & Badaruddin Mohamed¹

¹ School of Housing, Building and Planning, Universiti Sains Malaysia, Malaysia

Correspondence: Banafsheh M. Farahani, School of Housing, Building and Planning, Universiti Sains Malaysia, 11800 Penang, Malaysia. Tel: 61-17-446-7620. E-mail: banafsheh.farahani@gmail.com

Received: January 19, 2012  Accepted: February 20, 2012  Online Published: July 1, 2012
doi:10.5539/ach.v4n2p81  URL: http://dx.doi.org/10.5539/ach.v4n2p81

Abstract

In the new era of technology, internet turns to be one of the main sources of information, since it is considered cheaper and easier to use. Hence in tourism, two main pull factors influencing potential tourist to visit a destination are recognized as nature and culture which a destination offers. The acceptance of culture as one of the important factors in tourists’ motivation, heritage sites become popular in many countries especially those which are nominated as world heritage sites. This paper is to analyze the condition of available online information about George Town world heritage spots (Penang, Malaysia). As far as heritage is one of the products of tourism and tourism, on the other hand, is a big help for sustainability of heritage sites, providing sufficient information about tourism heritage sites as a promotional key is very important. Top ten tourism websites were chosen and content analysis was performed to find the current situation of those websites. By recognizing heritage as tangible and intangible, the result shows that although the intangible heritages need more concern in sustainability matter, but the information about them are not as complete as the tangible ones. Lack of proper information was seen in most websites and the focus of information was more on tangible heritage and among intangible heritage, the main focus was on food. To support the result of analysis, in-depth interviews were conducted by couple of heritage offices in the city. The main reason behind the lack of sufficient information about intangible heritage seems to be the lack of complete list of them and moreover, promoting this division of heritage needs negotiation with the local residence involving in those activities. The paper suggests providing a complete list of George Town world heritage as far as some of them are disappearing lately, and keeping this valuable world heritage sustainable for next generation needs detailed study and completing the list as soon as possible. In this regard those intangible heritages which are in hazard of disappearing can be maintained by the effort of key holders of the field. Moreover, providing the mentioned list helps the information providers, especially related websites to focus equally on tangible and intangible George Town world heritage.

Keywords: world heritage site, tangible and intangible heritage, George Town, information search, promotion and sustainability

1. Introduction

Tourism by its diverse variety changes to be one of the largest contributors in the economy of many countries. People travel to different destination by variety of purposes and one of the main motivational factors is to visit the heritage sites. Being nominated as a world heritage makes George Town as a famous place for tourist to visit Penang, Malaysia. Although other tourism activities such as beach tourism were active in the city, but recently the number of tourists arrival to visit the heritage sites increase rapidly. Different heritage values can be found in the area which is divided in two groups of tangible and intangible heritage. In a comprehensive view, cultural tourism is a competent generator for destinations to create revenue which brings opportunities to the host community. However, the cultural heritage of a destination has the potentiality to be a tourism product, but destination’s planners must flourish this latent. Hence, the responsibility of the destinations planners and marketers is to set a proper promotional plan. Pedersen (2002, p. 78) noted that:

Promotion can play an important role in meeting educational and financial goals and objectives.

If a site can accommodate greater numbers, and has a mechanism for retaining tourism
earnings, it can be promoted to draw in additional visitors and generate increased revenue for sustaining operations, solving management problems and meeting goals and objectives.

Of course, different cultural products cater different types of cultural tourists but there are some common factors among them. Silberberg (1995) points out that, cultural tourists stay longer and spend more money while on vacation and are highly educated compare to general public and in addition, they are in the older age group. Considering mentioned factors, it is obvious that this segment bring more profit and less negative impacts to destinations. A right promotional strategy should bring to light both tangible and intangible aspects of a destination.

Potential tourists search the necessary information from different sources and as it is confirmed, internet changes to be the main information source for them. Providing information in related website can play promotional role for the destination. Recognizing top ten web sites based on providing information about the case study of this paper helps the researchers to have a content analysis of each websites in order to find the amount of information about both tangible and intangible values and compare them together. The detail of the study will discuss as follows:

2. Defining Cultural Heritage

According to Imon et al. (2007, p. 1-3) “heritage means something that has been inherited from the past and which can be passed on to future generation” and “the meaning of the term, cultural heritage, has evolved over the last decades. Originally, it referred only to masterpieces of artistic and historic value; now it is used more broadly and covers everything that has a particular significance to people”. Over the time, different definitions of “cultural heritage” have been introduced by international organizations such as UNESCO and ICOMOS. In 1964, Venice charter used “historical monument” interpreting the definition of culture and ICOMOS in 1965 redefined it as ‘monuments’ and ‘site’, while, UNESCO divided “cultural property” into movable and immovable. The terminology of heritage yet to be standardized and uniformed by all countries, but internationally agreed to include ‘tangible’, ‘intangible’ and ‘environment’ (Ahmad, 2006).

As cited in Imon, et al. (2007, p. 2-4) UNESCO categorized cultural heritage into two distinguish groups as tangible and intangible heritage. “Tangible heritage is that which exist in material form, meaning that can be physically touched, such as monuments, buildings, work of art, paintings, object …etc. Intangible heritage is that which exist in immaterial form, for instance, music, dance, literature, theatre, languages, knowledge, local traditions …etc”.

Pervious definitions separated tangible heritage into movable (e.g. architectural works, monuments…etc) and immovable (e.g. museum collections, libraries…etc) but recently the importance of such distinction is reduced and all aspects of heritage were integrated together (Imon, et al., 2007). Intangible heritage includes all cultural aspects of a community which gather social values and tradition, customs, family values, cultural habits (wedding, marriage and delivery), cuisine, and traditional medicine that distinguishes the society from others (Brennan, 2005).

Clarke and Johnston (2003) argued that “there is, however, increasing recognition that intangible values play an important role in how people interact with their social and cultural environments” (p. 1). On the other hand, the Association of Southeast Asian Nations, (ASEAN) members (countries through the ASEAN) have been declared the outline of cultural heritage in July 2000 in Bangkok which provided a definition of cultural heritage closer to home (regional context). Based on definition which ASEAN have been recognized, cultural heritage contains following implications (Definition of Culture and Cultural Heritage section, par. 18):

- Significant cultural values and concepts;
- Structures and artefacts: dwellings, buildings for worship, utility structures, works of visual arts, tools and implements that are of a historical or scientific significance
- Sites and human habits: human creations or combined human creations and nature, archaeological sites and sites of living human communities that are of outstanding value from a historical aesthetic anthropological or ecological viewpoint or because of its natural feathers, of considerable importance as habitat for the culture survival and identity of particular living traditions
- Oral and folk heritage: folkways, folklore, languages and literature, traditional arts and crafts, architecture and the performing arts, games, indigenous knowledge system and practices, myths, customs and beliefs, rituals and other living traditions;
- The written heritage;
Popular cultural heritage: popular creativity in mass cultures, popular forms of expression of outstanding aesthetic, anthropological and sociological values, including the music, dance, graphic arts, fashion, game and sports, industrial design, cinema, television, music video, video arts and cyber art in technologically-oriented and urbanized communities.

Based on ASEAN definition for cultural heritage, oral and folk heritage and popular cultural heritage could be marked as intangible cultural heritage while structures, artifacts and sites considered as tangible heritage. The division is shown in Figure 1.

Figure 1. ASEAN definition of cultural heritage modified from ASEAN (2000)

Preserving intangible heritage and values that are related to a place is a crucial matter; hence they work as a connection between places, and social traditions. Moreover, these intangible elements of a place will help better understanding of tangible elements as well as making positive image related to that specific place (Clarke & Johnston, 2003). Intangible heritage in contrast with tangible heritage could not be protected in the museum as they consist of knowledge, skill and performance (cultural demonstration) which are undoubtedly linked to persons. It is widely accepted that, since tourism has been considered as an industry, it is known to generate income and bring benefits to the communities. It plays an important role to protect and preserve the heritage, thought sustainable promotion and sell of the culture is a discussable issue since it is as old as cultural tourism.

3. Cultural Tourism

By some means, defining cultural tourism is not simple as it looks like. Richards (2001) has defined cultural tourism as “the movement of persons to cultural attractions away from their normal place of residence, with the intention to gather new information and experiences to satisfy their cultural needs”. He used the term “intention to gather new information” to explain the notion of cultural tourism. While motivations to visit historical artistic places and lifestyle has been used by other researchers to define cultural tourism (Alzua, O'Leary, & Morrison, 1998; Silberberg, 1995). This subtle difference is the borderline between actual cultural tourist and who accidentally became a cultural tourist. However, visiting cultural aspects of the destination is a common motivation of a trip, and some tourists select specific destination just due to its cultural attractions. These are the one that Richard (2001) categorized as tourists with the intention to satisfy their cultural needs.
Richards, (2001, p. 7) explained that “Cultural tourism therefore covers not just the consumption of the cultural products of the past, but also of contemporary culture or the way of life of a people or region. Cultural tourism therefore has seen as covering both ‘heritage tourism’ (related to artifacts of the past) and ‘arts tourism’ (related to contemporary cultural production)”.

UNWTO (1985) presented two definition of cultural tourism that are known as narrow definition and wide definition.

- The narrow definition is “movement of persons for essentially cultural motivations such as study tours, performing arts and cultural tours, travel to festivals and other cultural events, visits to sites and monuments, travel to study nature, folklore or art, and pilgrimages”
- The wide definition is “all movement of persons...because they satisfy the human need for diversity, tending to raise the cultural level of the individual and giving rise to new knowledge, experience and encounters” (Richards, 1996, p. 22).

As tourism became one of the most fast growing industries in the world and due to the increase interest to cultural tourism specifically, the role of sustainable tourism is even more crucial. By planning an organized sustainable tourism, it is possible to attract more investors and founds meanwhile improving local community economy. Therefore, increasing the various activities that are related to the cultural sites, tourism can play a critical role to sustain those cultural assets. George Town as the case study of this paper is not an exception and literature shows the magnitude of this world heritage site among other nominated ones.

4. Tourism and Cultural Tourism in George Town, Penang

Penang Island (Pulau Pinang) is an area of land, approximately 294 km², lies off on the opposite of Malaysia’s mainland. The Island is connected to the mainland with the Penang Bridge, which is opened in 1985. British government pushed the Malay region for seeking trading opportunities during the late eighteen century when the East India Company was looking for eastern port in which to conduct business. As a result, Penang Island was yielded to the Company in 1786 (Handerson, 2004). People of all ethnic groups (European, Chinese, Indians, Bugis, Arabs, Armenians, Persians, Siamese and Sumatrans) were attracted by the settlement of the company (Mohamed, Ahmad, & Ismail, n.d.). Travel industry in its basic forms came to Penang region following by western trade, and after the China trade grew, more ships passed through the region. (Darke, 1970, p. 270) quoted that “It was also necessary to provide restaurant and refreshment ports (which) were just as important as trading ports”. Penang turned into a visitor centre soon after its foundation in 1789. The first indication of ‘tourist’ in Penang was in a travelogue originally published in 1834 (Begbie, 1967) and the first hotels such as Hotel de L’Europe, E & O, Runnymede and the hill bungalows were managed based on European needs and enterprise (Snodgrass, 1980).

By the 1990s, “sun, see and sand” tourism was realised at the peak capability in Penang (Cairns, 2002). Led by the state government, Penang did considerable movement towards promoting tourism and distributing its own products. Essentially, Penang cultural heritage sites have been promoted as an alternative tourism (Hamzah, 2004). Therefore, the amalgam of tourism products caters Penang’s visitors. Modern shopping centres and local bazaars as well as night markets, beautiful beaches, presenting variety of ethnics with variety of culture, customs, foods, lifestyle, and signs of different religion (Indus and Buddhists temples and mosques) could be seen within a natural cultural-historical environment (Penang Tourism, 2009).

In July 2008, “George Town and Malacca listed as World Heritage Sites”. The nomination as a ‘World Heritage Site’ status by UNESCO has brought great opportunity to develop cultural tourism in George Town. The uniqueness of Melaka and George Town is about combination of religious pluralism, historic townscape and living heritage. These three unique items have been represented through house of worship and peaceful co-existence of different religious, a combination of Asian and colonial architectures and multicultural heritage which peeps out from the daily lives, rituals, trades and cuisine of the inner city community (Nasution, 2008, Nov). The World Heritage Site status by UNESCO drives attention towards developing culture-heritage tourism. As Penang Economic Monthly (2009) reported:

In line with the growing numbers of global travelers seeking different kind of holidays that is not packaged as a rushed shopping/sightseeing tour trip. Not surprisingly, many countries that heavily depend on tourism are increasingly gearing their tourism industry to cater for these ‘culture-vulture’ travelers, who are deemed a more profitable and sustainable market (p. 7).

Khoo Salma Nasution at the RARC International Tourism Conference (2008, Nov) quoted that:
In many ways, Georgetown is just another urban area where people live, work and go shopping. But the high concentration of houses of worship and association buildings, the relatively walkable street scape of shop houses and the close proximity of various attractions, gives Georgetown ambience of an open-air museum or museum without wall (p. 6).

The composition of a day life in George Town is made by Indian shopkeepers selling fabrics, flowers and religious statues in little India, Chinese shop houses with different skills that rooted in their culture (e.g. hand-made joss sticks, engraving wooden signboards) as well as Malay community who have their own symbols of culture (e.g. Malay cuisines and handicrafts). In fact George Town has the capability to be a focal point for Malaysia tourism. As reported by the Penang State Tourism official Website (2011) during 2008 Penang was blessed by receiving 6.3 million tourists excluding those visited Penang on cruises, day trips, and VFRs. Comparing 5.1 million tourist reception in 2007, Penang obviously benefited from being World Heritage City in 2008 (Table 1).

Table 1. Total number of Penang tourist arrival from 1999-2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total of tourists million</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>4.35</td>
<td>4.71</td>
<td>5.18</td>
<td>6.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: www.seri.com.my

As mentioned before, providing information for potential tourist can play an important role in promoting destinations. Probable tourists gain the necessary information from different sources which the detailed explanation can be found in the next section of this paper.

5. Information Search

In today’s tourism competitive marketplace, understanding tourist information search behavior is an essential factor for marketing management to have effective marketing strategy through effective source/s. According to Moutinho (1987), an expressed need to check diverse sources before decision making is called information search. Referring to this definition, Fodness and Murray (1999) discuss about three main factors in tourism information search. They affirm motives, determinants and sources as those three factors. The potential tourists search for information in their travel planning stage to expand the quality of their trip (McIntosh and Goeldner, 1990). This searching for information helps them to get information and general idea about the destination as well as available services, attraction, price and alike. “Planning as a first step for any traveling requires adequate information which potential tourist may gain it through different sources. Travelers use various amounts and types of information through internal and external search to support their decision making in both areas of which place to visit and the available services they can have access in the chosen destination to reduce risk and uncertainty” (Farahani and Mohamed, 2009, P. 46).

In the first level, probable travelers search information from internal sources which Fodness and Murray (1997) defined it as past experience in the particular destination or the similar one/s. In most cases this level of information search doesn’t help travelers to fulfill their needs completely. There is either no useful experience or if there is, the details are forgotten or need to be updated. Accordingly travelers move to the next level to get the information from external sources. In one perspective, external sources can be divided into commercial or noncommercial and received from personal or impersonal communication (Fodness and Murray, 1999).

The revolution in information technology, IT, in recent years include internet in the main list of external information sources. As tourism has information oriented nature, (Schertler, et al., 1995) and decision making and consumption are separated in time and space, information can be the only tool to overcome these distances (Kim, et al., 2007). In advance available information related to product can gain from internet in an easier and cheaper way. The importance of internet in tourism external information search has been confirmed by number of scholars (Bonn et al., 1999). Dolores, et al., (2008, p. 166) by referring to previous studies have been done in this area mentioned that “it is virtually impossible for tourism organization to overlook the internet in their marketing mixes due to its advantages, which include global accessibility, convenience in updating, real-time information service, interactive communications features and unique customization capabilities.

Moreover, Dolores et al. (2008) confirmed the importance of internet in information search when assert that “the advent of the internet and the possibility of interacting with the information carried by that new medium has
opened up a range of possibilities for investigating the way in which information processing takes place and differences in that respect between the internet and the more traditional media”. Biswas (2004) also refer to the cost of internet which is lower than other traditional media as a main factor which make people to search for their information comparing to other sources. The mentioned reasons make the focus of this paper on internet as tourist main information source.

6. An Overview

The current paper is to analyze the available websites which provide information about George Town world heritage site in Penang, Malaysia. As far as the literature shows, now a day, internet turns to be a main source of information for potential tourists and as stated before, it is the major reason to choose it in this paper. Previously, two types of heritage; tangible and intangible, were elaborated and this study focus on both tangible and intangible heritage sites information provided in different main websites in the area of study. List of top ten informative website about the case study was provided by Penang global tourism as; Asia web, Penang global tourism, Yahoo Travel, Cuti.com, Penang heritage trust, Visit Penang 2010-2012, visit Penang, wiki travel, Penang Tourism and Pulau Pinang.

The content analysis was done to find the amount of information about each type separately. The result was checked by interviewing authorities from Penang Heritage Office and Penang Heritage Trust to find the reason/s behind the issue. Respectfully, the result is discussed as follows:

7. Results

The result of content analysis of each website is presented separately in this part and it is shown that although the complete information can not be found but some websites provided as much available information as possible.

7.1 Asia Web

This website, http://www.asiawebdirect.com/malaysia/penang/?q=Penang, has been designed for marketing purposes. It is one of the pioneers providing travelers with information to plan their trip within Asia since 1993. It is a member of the Pacific Asia Travel Association (PATA) and the International Air Travel Association (IATA). The result shows that under tangible heritage category, this website advertised building for worship, dwelling, site of living human communities, and architecture. In case of intangible heritage, traditional arts and crafts, identity of particular living traditions, traditional cuisine, and Penang’s culture have been introduced. Moreover, a brief history of historical building and monuments is elaborated.

7.2 Penang Global Tourism

Penang Global Tourism is the new state tourism bureau set up to work with key tourism players inside & outside of Penang. It is the promotion body of state tourism, to promote the state as a tourist destination. Almost all types of existing tangible heritage promoted in this website, http://penangglobaltourism.com/directory.html, such as; dwellings, buildings for worship, human creations, sites of living human communities, works of visual arts, and architecture. In terms of intangible heritage, the website introduces traditional arts & crafts, customs & beliefs, rituals & other living traditions, folklore, as well as popular forms of expression of outstanding aesthetic.

7.3 Yahoo Travel

The website, http://travel.yahoo.com/p-travelguide-191501653-penang_vacations-i, works with online advertising companies to provide travelers with advertising and promotions related to the destinations all over the world. As it is not specifically promoting Penang, so it provides information is general. The website categorized Penang attractions as “Explore the Kampong Sungai Keluang Attractions” that is an unfamiliar name to address Penang, hence, it is challenging for travelers to select attraction located in George Town heritage enclave as the attractions are not categorized based on where they are located. Dwellings, buildings for worship, and architecture are the type of tangible heritage that mentioned in this website. Traditional cuisine, traditional arts & crafts, and rituals & other living traditions are the intangible heritage that spelled out.

7.4 Cuti.com

CUTI, www.cuti.com.my, is an internet travel reservation and information gateway for Malaysia. The aim of website is to offer online travel services, including ticketing, hotel and tour reservation as well as facilitating search and planning before reaching the destination. They have talked about islands & beaches, places of interest, and hills/forest parks. There is no introduction about George Town world heritage site though they have mentioned few tangible heritages (Dwellings and buildings for worship) and traditional mode of transport (Trishaw) is the only intangible heritage that mentioned in this website.
7.5 Penang Heritage Trust

Formed in 1986, The Penang Heritage Trust (PHT) is one of the leaders to preserve the history and culture of Penang and to promote revitalization of George Town as a living heritage city. They also plan and trace the ongoing heritage movement in Penang. In their website, www.pht.org.my, they promote three heritage tours, Little India & Pinang Peranakan Mansion tour, Heritage Trail & Cheong Fatt Tze mansion tour and street of Harmony & Historical Enclave. It is an informative website that provides valuable information regard to George Town World heritage site for those who plan to visit the town. The dwellings, buildings for worship, sites of living human communities, and architecture are the categories of tangible heritage that PHT has listed during their offered tours. Furthermore, traditional arts & crafts, identity of particular living traditions, customs & beliefs are the intangible heritage that will be discussed during their offered tour.

7.6 Visit Penang 2010-2012

It is Penang state tourism official website, http://www.visitpenang.gov.my, which reports the previous event, while the information about upcoming events also provided. History of Penang, festivals, food and blogger are the other informational link in this website. Some videos are provided for those who are interested to watch videos rather than reading about the information. There are links entitled “what to see” which provide information about attraction in Penang. Again in this website the number of buildings for worship is higher than other tangible heritage. Human creations also can be seen among the available information. For the intangible heritage, the main information is about Penang’s Traditional Joss Stick Maker and Penang Chinese Opera & Ko-Tai. It is better to say that this website is not a proper informative website since the number of heritage information there, is limited, although some brochure can be downloaded easily from the website to get related information.

7.7 Visit Penang

This website introduces the holiday destination of the island of Penang in Malaysia. This site features links to traveler reviews, travel guides, and resources. The address is http://www.visitpenang.com/ and it is linked to other informative sources such as’ Penang Heritage Trust, Travel and Local News including All Malaysia Info, Penang Hawker, Food Blog, Penang Foods, iGeorgeTown News, and Penang News. Travel Overviews including Wikipedia and Wikitravel as well as Virtual Tourist and IgoUgo can also be found. Local Links including Little Penang, Street Market, Penang Heritage Trust, iGeorgeTown, and other links including TripAdvisor, Penang Story are the other available links. The result of content analysis of this website shows that regarding to tangible heritage the information are all around two main parts of tangible heritage (dwellings and buildings for worship), although museum and traditional transportation also can be found in the list. Regarding intangible heritage the main focus of the website is on food which of course is just one of the intangible elements. Festivals are the other main focus of the website in intangible perspective.

7.8 Tourism Penang

Tourism Penang, http://www.tourismpenang.net.my, is another website which is one of the main tourists’ information providing sources. The number of useful information for tourists in this website is more detailed comparing to other websites. To some extent the website provide information about Tangible Cultural Heritage by “What to see”, and Intangible Cultural Heritage by “What to do”. Same as other websites, the information about buildings for worship can be seen more than other information although the information about George Town World Heritage are the most complete one among other websites. They came with the idea of top ten what to see, what to eat, and what to do to make it easy for potential tourist to choose. Regarding tangible heritage all major heritage buildings and clan houses in the George Town inner city can be seen in the website. More over buildings for worship can also be found. Food and transportation are the items related to intangible heritage in the website information.

7.9 Wiki Travel

It is a division of Wikipedia by the address of http://wikitravel.org/en/Penang#. Very general information about different tourism spots can be found in that website. The information is not by detail and it can be used only to get the general information about the destination. Very small information about both tangible and intangible heritage is presented in that webpage. Among tangible heritage values, buildings for worship, sites of living human communities, works of visual arts, and architecture can be seen. In terms of intangible heritage, the website provide information about customs & beliefs, rituals & other living traditions, food, as well as identity of particular living tradition. The website suggested some tourism related division to get more information such as Penang Tourism Action Council, Tourism Malaysia, Penang Tourist Centre, Penang Development Corporation Tourism.
Division, Tourism Information Centre, Tourism Malaysia Penang Branch, Penang Heritage Trust and The Penang Old House.

7.10 Pulau Pinang

Although the name of this website, http://www.pulaupinang.com, is in Malay language but the information provided by this website is in English and can be useful for international users. They call it the E-gateway to Gorge Town World Heritage City. In this website the information are categorized under eight divisions. The first division is “about Penang” which subcategorized by George Town, History, and Penang Story. The second main division is “Happiness” including, tourism views, tourism events, travel alert and travelogue. The third division is “World Heritage” which provides news regarding to world heritage and events. Forth division entitled “Tourist Attraction” and explains about culture, religion and nature. Next partition is “Penang Mall” which mostly provides information about food, restaurant and shopping. “Art and Culture” is another division which includes information about art craft, performing art, and religion and custom that can be categorized under traditional cuisine, art and crafts, culture, and customs and beliefs subgroups of intangible heritage. “Media” is the division which minimize to; opinion, 3D panoramic, Penang TV, photos and post cards. The last division is “Tourist Map” which obviously provides different necessary maps for tourists. Like Penang Global Tourism, nearly most information about all types of existing tangible heritage is provided in this website. Dwellings, buildings for worship, human creations, sites of living human communities, works of visual arts, and architecture are the examples of tangible heritage items. In terms of intangible heritage, the website promotes traditional arts & crafts, customs & beliefs, rituals & other living traditions, folklore, and popular forms of expression of outstanding aesthetic.

8. Conclusion and Implication

As far as heritage is a very valuable attraction for tourism and to be considered as the main tourism motivational factors, its sustainability facilitates tourism industry. On the other hand, tourism can play an important role in sustainability of heritage especially intangible ones. The brief result of the content analysis is shown in table 2.

Table 2. Tangible and intangible information in top ten penang tourism websites

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Website</th>
<th>Tangible Heritage</th>
<th>Intangible Heritage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asia Web</td>
<td>building for worship, dwelling, site of living human communities, and architecture</td>
<td>traditional arts and crafts, Identity of particular living traditions, traditional cuisine, Penang’s culture, history of historical building and monuments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penang Global Tourism</td>
<td>dwellings, buildings for worship, human creations, sites of living human communities, works of visual arts, and architecture</td>
<td>traditional arts &amp; crafts, customs &amp; beliefs, rituals &amp; other living traditions, folklore, also popular forms of expression of outstanding aesthetic &amp; traditional cuisine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yahoo Travel</td>
<td>dwellings, buildings for worship, and architecture</td>
<td>traditional cuisine, traditional arts &amp; crafts, and rituals &amp; other living traditions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cuti.com</td>
<td>dwellings and buildings for worship</td>
<td>traditional mode of transport</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penang Heritage Trust</td>
<td>dwellings, buildings for worship, sites of living human communities, and architecture</td>
<td>traditional arts &amp; crafts, identity of particular living traditions, customs &amp; beliefs are the intangible heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visit Penang 2010-2012</td>
<td>buildings for worship</td>
<td>art and crafts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Visit Penang</td>
<td>dwellings, buildings for worship &amp; museum</td>
<td>traditional transportation, traditional cuisine &amp; festivals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Penang</td>
<td>buildings for worship, works of visual arts</td>
<td>Traditional cuisine, traditional arts &amp; crafts</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The result of the study reveals that there is no complete information about all heritage values in George Town and through the interviews it is found that the reason behind the shortage of information is lack of complete list of heritage items therefore, websites don’t have access to the complete list in order to provide the information according to it. Moreover, since the list is not available, some of the values are disappearing as there is no proper check list to use in order to update the information regarding to the condition of different values.

Comparing tangible and intangible heritage, it is clear that the intangible heritage are more sensible in case of sustainability, and as far as they are intangible so there is less policy and plan towards their conservation. Assessing the reason behind the minor information about intangible heritage comparing to the tangible ones, leads the researchers to know that providing and uploading information about intangible information needs key holders and trades owners agreement which is not an easy job and this negotiation takes lots of time, and efforts.

The result of interviews reveals the fact that, the appearance of the city is changing every three months which the reason behind it can be withdrawing one of the valuable intangible heritage every time since they can not compete with others. Moreover, minor businesses such as fortune telling are disappearing since the people behind these heritage values don’t afford to keep the business active.

It is definitely needed to provide a complete list of both tangible and intangible heritage and make it available for different websites to provide their information by referring to the list. Negotiations with the people behind intangible heritage should be considered as a serious issue since; when they disappear it is too late to care about.

Acknowledgements
This research was undertaken under the fellowship support of the Universiti Sains Malaysia.

References


